

A QUALITATIVE EVALUATION OF
THE COMMUNITY WORK PROGRAMME
UMTHWALUME CWP



OCTOBER 2011

COMPILED BY:

THUTONG TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT

TABLE OF CONTENT

1.	Purpose ...1
2.	Method...1
3.	Findings...2
3.1	General beneficiaries from the community who have been impacted by the services provided by CWP...2
3.1.1	Interviewees...2
3.1.2	Result...2
3.2	Beneficiaries who have been impacted by the services provided in a school by teachers assistants...5
3.2.2	Interviewees...5
3.2.1	Results...5
3.3	Beneficiaries who have received home based care or family members who have been impacted by the services...8
3.3.1	Interviewees...8
3.3.2	Results...9
3.4	Beneficiaries who have been working to provide services in the community...11
3.4.1	Interviewees...11
3.4.2	Results...12
4.	Conclusion...15

A qualitative evaluation of CWP

1. Purpose

This qualitative evaluation aims to answer the following questions:

- How have beneficiaries been impacted by CWP?
- How can CWP be developed and improved according to its beneficiaries?

2. Method

Using focus group as a method was identified in order to best achieve the above outlined purpose. Focus groups facilitate the expression of ideas and experiences that might be left underdeveloped in an individual interview. Focus groups also illuminate the participants' perspective through debate within the group.

The interviewees were selected in accordance with purposive sampling. This meant that beneficiaries were selected, who have been impacted by the programme and who have been involved over time, in order to evaluate the process. The technical support manager assessed that the evaluation should be carried out in ward 17 and ward 18 in Mtwalume, as the CWP was initially rolled out in this area in 2009. All beneficiaries were therefore selected from this area. Four main categories of beneficiaries were identified in order to give a holistic insight to the impact of the programme. These categories were identified by the technical support manager.

The following categories were identified:

1. General beneficiaries from the community who have been impacted by the services provided through CWP.
2. Beneficiaries who have been impacted by the services provided in a school by teachers assistants.
3. Beneficiaries who have received home based care or family members who have been impacted by the service.
4. Beneficiaries who have been working to provide services in the community through CWP.

Each category of beneficiaries was recruited to attend one focus group discussion. The evaluation consequently consisted of four focus groups that met at different occasions. The beneficiaries were recruited by the CWP co-ordinators and the co-ordinators also organised the venue for the focus groups. This means that the interviewees selected were most likely beneficiaries who the co-ordinators believe have been positively impacted by the programme. This is however not an issue as this selection process is in line with the purpose and main questions of the evaluation. Four focus group discussions were conducted with 7-11 interviewees per group. Each group discussion lasted approximately one hour. The discussion guide (Appendix A,B,C,D) consisted of four main questions. The facilitator used follow up questions and enquiries to gain deeper understanding during the interview. The group discussions were recorded on audio recorder and written transcriptions made of the interview conversation word for word translated from Zulu to

English. The data was then analysed through data grouping, information labels, knowledge findings, development of theories and implications. The interviewees gave their consent to their name and details appearing in the final report. There were interviewees who were minors and their guardians hereby gave their consent.

3. Findings

3.1 General beneficiaries from the community who have been impacted by the services provided through CWP.

3.1.1 Interviewees

The co-ordinators were briefed to recruit 8-10 community members who had benefited from various CWP projects in the community. The focus group discussion was carried out at the multi purpose centre in ward 17. The following interviewees participated in the focus group:

1. Mjweni Pinky is unemployed and has a disabled child in a crèche where CWP is assisting.
2. Malunga Fikelephi is unemployed and has children in a crèche where CWP is assisting.
3. Jeza Simphiwe is a labourer in construction.
4. Dlamini Ncamsile is unemployed.
5. Ngcobo Thabile is unemployed.
6. Mchunu Wiseman is an administrator at Child Welfare South Africa.
7. Mbili Landiwe is unemployed.

The turnout in terms of actual number of interviewees was slightly poor but focus groups as a method are not dependant on numbers.

3.1.2 Results

The community members point out that CWP has created employment in their community which has lead to a decrease in crime.

"I noticed that CWP worked for our community. Because people were doing nothing at all but now CWP collected and employed those people."

"The biggest change is everyone who was not working now works with CWP."

"CWP helped a lot with the crime in our community. There was too much crime in this community but all of those people now are at work."

"All the programmes from CWP benefit everybody. There were children who were thieves but CWP took those people to work."

They further point to an impact on both poverty and crime.

"The life of poor families was terrible and the community used to be more affected by crime."

"There used to be too much crime and poverty was worse."

The community members describe that there have been improvements in terms of infrastructure and the overall appearance of the community.

“There is a big difference because every where is clean now. It used to be dirty. There were always bottles and dirty things along the road.”

“I also noticed that they like what they do because the cleaning people they made a design with white stones which says CWP. That is good and nice.”

“They also make the road in a right way; they fixed the potholes and enlarged the road. Now the school children can pass and there is no disturbance.”

“CWP helped with the road. We were struggling at home with transport to take patients to the clinic but CWP made the road for us and now we don’t struggle anymore.”

The community members further shared that CWP has benefited the whole community through various projects and that it has impacted children and families.

“The whole community benefited especially the sick people, children at school and children at crèches.”

“The biggest change in our community is that families are improving their lives.”

“They help us a lot because some children stay alone at home but they help them.”

They also point out that the gardens specifically have assisted children and families.

“CWP help so much at school because they plant vegetables and take those vegetables and cook them at school. Because there are some children who come to school without having eaten anything at home.”

“The children benefit from the vegetable garden because they eat food that is healthy for their bodies.”

“The garden helps the poor families because if you ask them to give to a poor family they do. The people from that family then have something to cook.”

The community members express that CWP has improved the crèches by mainly assisting with cleaning.

“They also clean at crèches because the crèches are clean now.”

“The crèches we have are controlled by the department of government. Department of health, social development they come and check the crèches and everything is perfect especially cleanliness.”

“The crèches were dirty and the parents did not pay in time but now CWP cleaned up all the mess.”

They further point out that providing home based care is both needed and important for the community.

“I have seen that especially home based care is important. They care about your treatment, they ask you to eat food and to take your pills in a nice way.”

"I saw CWP helping my neighbour who is sick. He is old and his grand children stay with him. The home based care washed the grandfather and they cooked something for him to eat."

"I saw it is important especially the home based care for those who are sick and for disabled children."

The community members identify improvements that could be made for the people who provide services through CWP in the community and that the working days need to be increased.

"I would add to the training skills if I was the boss of CWP."

"More days for the workers and they don't have helping equipment."

"To increase money that will give them more love for what they do."

"If CWP add days that will help because the people who are sick get help only few days. Other times there is short time which is not good for the people who are sick."

They further question the efficiency and the size the CWP management and point out that this matter needs to be assessed and evaluated.

"To cut other programme which are not important. Like people who are at top level maybe don't do their work in a right way. I don't know which one but they should check everything at top level."

"Maybe there are too many leaders who do nothing so government should look at that."

3.2 Beneficiaries who have been impacted by the services provided in a school by teachers assistants

3.2.1 Interviewees

The evaluation was carried out with beneficiaries from a school that the technical support manager identified. The co-ordinators were briefed to recruit a total of 8-10 beneficiaries, including students, parents, teachers and members of the school governing body, from Gobhela School in ward 17. The focus group discussion was carried out at the school. The following beneficiaries participated in the focus group:

1. Cele Ndaba who has been part of the school governing body for 1 year.
2. Shabalala Nomasonto who has been part of the school governing body for 3 years.
3. Gwala Zilungile who has been part of the school governing body for 3 years.
4. Ngcobo Khanyisile is a parent of two children in the school in grade 2 and grade 4.
5. Madlala Thembi is a parent of two children in the school in grade 3 and grade 6.
6. Ngcobo Samkelisiwe is a student in grade 7.
7. Mthethwa Mlamuli is a student in grade 7.
8. Gumede J.R has been a teacher at the school for 20 years.
9. Mrs Msomi has been a teacher at the school for 11 years.
10. Magubane I.B has been a teacher at the school for 6 years.

3.2.2 Results

The teachers describe that the CWP teachers' assistants were very much needed at the school as they were overloaded with work and social problems among the students.

"We used to be overloaded with work. You need to clean the class room, keep everything up to date, do school work, clean the toilet, and supervise the learners. So everything was messy. It was really a relief to get an assistant."

"They help as I have 75 children in my class."

"We have challenges like orphans and vulnerable children, teenage pregnancies so we need more hands."

The parents and the teachers point out that the presence of CWP teachers' assistants particularly benefit slow learners.

"To have an assistant helped my child who is a slow learner a lot. Even the child's writing is improving."

"While we are working with the fast learners they help the slow learners and also vice versa."

"They also help a lot with the slow learners. I am teaching the young ones so we help each other."

The parents and the students report that academic results have improved since the CWP teachers' assistants are present in the classrooms.

"I can see the difference in my child. Since the assistants are there the children get help easier."

"My report is very good since working together with the assistant."

"Technology is hard for me but I go to the assistant and she helps me. One day I asked the assistant and she said to me that if I look in my note book everything is there, I checked and I got 16 out of 16."

"I can see the difference at home in my child as she had a problem with maths. She used to fail maths but now since there is an assistant she passed the subject."

"As a student it used to be very hard to concentrate at school because when we went back home from school we asked ourselves what have we learnt at school today."

The students and the teachers further point out that the teachers' assistants positively impact and help to manage disruptive and challenging behaviours among students.

"If they are not there the children will play and make noise."

"You need to know why the child is behaving badly. The assistant is there to help you with that child and is able to solve the problem."

"I have noticed that we don't push each other and we don't play roughly."

The students and the teachers share that the CWP teachers assistants are needed and valuable, when the teacher is absent from the class room.

"As a student if the teacher was not in the class we used to go out and make noise."

“If the teacher was busy marking for 2 or 3 days no teacher comes in to the class. That was not good for us because we did not learn anything.”

“If the teacher was not in we used to read any subject by ourselves, no one helping us.”

“Here at the school we have teacher management meetings so at those times we need the assistant to help the children to continue with school work.”

The representatives from the school governing board and the teachers describe how the fact that CWP brings people from the community in to the school has had a positive impact. They refer to benefits for individual students, for families and for the school as a whole.

“They understand the situation of the child as they are from this community. I am not from the community and stay far away. They assist us when we write a letter to ask parents to come to school but nobody comes because the child has no one who is responsible for him at home.”

“They also know the children who are poor and take vegetables from the garden and give it to that family.”

“There is not much vandalism of the school now because the people from the community see everything that goes on.”

“We had thieves around the school who were stealing material from the school but since the community worked together with CWP they inform the teacher of what they have heard about the stolen goods.”

Students, teachers and representatives of the board describe that the CWP teachers assistants have contributed to increased safety for the students

“When it is break time they supervise the children. They make sure the children don’t injure themselves and also that they socialise in a good way.”

“The young children come out first then we follow them a few minutes in order not to push the young children. And also the security by the road helps us when we cross the road.”

“Since the assistants are in the school I have noticed that there are no children who have been in a car accident because they go with them the whole way.”

The representatives from the board and the teachers point out that there is a need for improvements of policies and procedures related to the CWP teachers’ assistants function in the school.

“They need job description and schedules.”

“They also need to get an introduction when they start so that we know them and so they know what we expect from them.”

“We need them to arrive in time with the teacher.”

“The assistants need to be sent to lower grades than what they have themselves.”

The teachers further pointed out that a report system need to be developed between themselves and the CWP co-ordinators.

“They should have a programme where they inform the teacher what they have done and what they are doing. There is no communication between the teachers and the co-ordinators.”

“The teachers must report to the co-ordinator.”

“They should have a report day to communicate with their co-ordinators and teacher. If we can give some report because we need to write down how we worked together and give it to the co-ordinator.”

The representatives from the school governing body and the teachers share that they believe that the CWP teachers’ assistants should receive training while working at the school.

“To have assistants help a lot because we are working together and if there is something we misunderstand we sort it out together. I think it also gives them experience but I don’t know how they will use it because they need to go to university.”

“The assistants need training while they are at school.”

“If the programme run for 4 to 5 years the question is what are these people going to do after that.”

“Training them will give them more skills, they must move out from school having something in their hands.”

3.3 Beneficiaries who have received home based care or family members who have been impacted by the service.

3.3.1 Interviewees

The co-ordinators were briefed to recruit 8-10 beneficiaries with both home based care patients and family members represented. The focus group discussion was carried out at the multi purpose centre in ward 17. The following interviewees participated in the focus group:

1. Judy Mbhele who is a CWP home based care patient.
2. George Nkabane who is a CWP home based care patient.
3. Dudu Thusi who is a CWP home based care patient.
4. Ntombi Mndabe who is a CWP home based care patient.
5. Gideon Mqadi who is a CWP home based care patient.
6. Welcome Mbhele who is a family member of a patient receiving home based care provided by CWP.
7. Bongie Nkabane who is a family member of a patient receiving home based care provided by CWP.

The turnout in terms of the number of interviewees was slightly poor especially in terms of benefiting family members. Focus groups as a method is however not dependant on numbers. Another challenge during the actual interview was that some of the patients struggled to communicate their stories mainly due to very poor hearing. The facilitator did however try to overcome these challenge and all participants did give their in put.

3.3.2 Results

Patients describe how they lacked anyone to support them and how they had no one to help them before home-based care workers from CWP started to assist them

"They cut my feet because my leg was rotten. I was crying all the time, who is going to help me?"

"No one helped me at all. My family was far away."

"No one helped me from department of health."

"I am sick, my legs are twisted. My mother has passed away and my brother has passed away. The wife of my brother and his children they are staying in Madlala. I was staying alone at home. I felt unhappy because I had no one to help me."

Patients and family members point out that there are tasks that relatives struggle to assist the sick patients with.

"I am only staying with this granddaughter. She is young and it was hard for her to bathe me and take me wherever I need to go as I am blind."

"I was looking after my grandmother and it was hard for me to bathe her as I am a male."

"My life was difficult because sometimes when I need to bathe him I just say when you want me to bathe you at your back tell me and to help him with the private parts is difficult for me. It was hard because my aunt is also sick."

The patients describe how they struggle to carry out essential tasks and how they are unable to manage to do many things by themselves.

"My life is not good because my hands are not working at all. Everything is messed up at home even my room is falling apart. I don't know how to do anything."

"My life was not good at all because I did not know to do things on my own. Like to take the pills. I always forgot to take the pills and that I was supposed to eat food."

"I used to see that my grand child needs something but for me it is very hard to help her."

The patients and the family members further point out that the home based carer from CWP has assisted them by carrying out some of these essential tasks and by helping them with things that they struggle with.

"The biggest change for me is that they fetch water, do washing for me, clean the yard and help my grandchild."

"I did not used to take the pills in time. When I went to the clinic my B.P had decreased because I had taken the pills thanks to the home based carer. She reminds me to go to the clinic like tomorrow."

"I need help to bathe my grandfather because I can't go out and ask for help. Luckily home based carers help me to bathe him."

The patients further express how the CWP home based carer gives them emotional and social support.

“Home based care is very important because they help the people who don’t have children. They just help you like they are family.”

“There is civilisation in our community since CWP take part in our lives. You can see them even when they are far away; here come our helpers.”

“I did not know that there will be a person who will see me. That I am alone and that I need help.”

The family members share how caring for a sick relative has impacted their life. They point out that the CWP home based carer does not solve the issue of the patient being dependent on them but that they provide relief and support.

“My life was not good at all because I could not go and look for a job. I was supposed to be at home all the time and also asking my mother if she wants something to eat.”

“I can’t leave my grandfather alone. When the home based care is there to take care of him I can leave him and go to school. The problem is that no one can look after him all the time.”

“The biggest change for me is that I used to stay with my grandfather and I had no one to speak with, but now I can speak with them like they are family.”

The patients and family members give their opinion on the quality of service that they receive from the CWP home based carers.

“They are trained because my brother says that the home based care lady is treating my grandmother like she is a doctor.”

“I agree they are trained the ones who are taking care of me.”

The patients point out that they think that CWP could assist them further by providing access to a garden.

“We also need small gardens at home. We can’t get something to eat because the CWP garden is far away from us. It is not helping us.”

“There is no project garden where we live. I think they should make a project garden or small garden at our homes.”

The patients further express they need assistance from the home based carers more frequently.

“They need to add days because if they go to one family they can’t reach another family.”

“I agree that they should add days because if they are not with us we struggle.”

3.4 Beneficiaries who have been working to provide services in the community

3.4.1 Interviewees

The co-ordinators were briefed to recruit 8-10 beneficiaries who had provided different types of services in the community and beneficiaries representing different age groups. The focus group discussion was carried out at the multi purpose centre in ward 17. The following beneficiaries participated in the focus group:

1. Fikile Mnganga who is 24 years old and works as a teachers assisstant for CWP

2. Lushaba Velile who is 30 years old and works as teachers assistant for CWP.
3. Mthembu Themba who is 58 years old and works as a cleaner for CWP.
4. Nyawose Ntombenhle who is 26 years old and works as a cleaner for CWP.
5. Shazi Prisca who is 54 years old and works as a gardener for CWP.
6. Lugayeni Elizabeth who is 62 years old and works as a home based carer for CWP.
7. Myende Lindiwe who is 48 years old and works as a home based carer for CWP.
8. Gumbi Lorraine who is 48 years old and works as a home based carer for CWP.
9. Sthole Thulisile who is 27 years old and works as a teachers assistant for CWP.

3.4.2 Results

The beneficiaries who provide services through CWP describe how the stipend they receive has enabled them to improve their families' lives.

"CWP is very helpful especially amongst the poorer families in the community, because now we are able to earn money to put food on the table."

"My mother lost her job in 2008 and no one was working at home and in 2009 she passed away and things got worse, it was hard for me to cope because when kids came back from school I couldn't give them anything because I was also hungry but now they come and know they will eat."

"With this money I earn I have been able to put my kids through school."

"I am a pensioner responsible for supporting seven people and we all shared a one room house, things are much easier now because I am extending the house and its all thanks to CWP."

They further share that they used to be struggle financially and be socially isolated before they became involved with The CWP.

"Before CWP came it was very hard I was going around asking for food to my neighbours."

"I used to stay at home all day long doing nothing."

"I had no money and I felt isolated because I did not communicate with anyone and I could not afford to buy food for my kids."

"I was very stressed but now I know I have people to talk with when I have problems."

The beneficiaries who provide service in the community point they have improved their financial management skills through CWP.

"My life has changed because I am now free from loan sharks because every time I needed money I used to go and borrow from them."

"My life has changed because even when I walk on the street I feel free and I don't have any worries and CWP has helped us learn how to save money from the little that we earn. And I wished this was introduced from the start of CWP."

They also describe how they have developed on a personal level through their participation with The CWP.

“CWP has helped me a lot because I own a shop and it was hard sometimes to go buy new stock. But now with the little money I earn, I am able to buy and fill my shop and I am able to go to the bank and withdraw money.”

“CWP has helped me a lot because as a young person with matric it was always my wish to go to university but I did not have information as to how to apply and did not have money. But now that I am doing teacher aid things are starting to be clearer and I see the need to further my studies.”

“What I can say is that CWP has helped me a lot because with the money I get I have now obtained my drivers licence.”

The beneficiaries who provide service in the community do however express that financial support from CWP is needed in order for them to be able to study further.

“It is my request to the CWP to provide loans or maybe bursaries to especially the youth under the CWP programme to further their studies because most of them have matric but they do not afford to go to universities.”

“Provide loans or bursaries because the money we earn is too little for us to afford tertiary education.”

“Please if CWP could give youth bursaries because we have matric and want to continue with our studies.”

They further express that the work that they do is important for their community and that it is making a difference.

“We are very important as cleaners for the crèches. The crèches are next to the forest so I look after the children like a security.”

“Since I started working as a teacher aid I have realise how important my presence is to both the teacher and the kids because I help the slow learners to catch up with the rest of the class because the teaches have so much to do they sometimes do not attend to the more needy kids”

“CWP is helping so much with home based care because people are very sick especially the youth and you find out that they are under the care of their elders and they find it hard to help especially when it comes to bathing because they old they don’t have energy.”

“There are children who have problems in their families and we sort that problem for the child.”

The beneficiaries who provide services in the community through CWP also express that the days, that they provide services, need to be extended.

“When 8 days is over it is hard to leave seeing that there is piles of work to be done so we are then forced to volunteer because of the work load.”

“For us who work with Home Base Care it is difficult for people that we work with to cope during our day off.”

“Increase the number of days because people we help suffer during the days when we are off.”

They also point to a lack and need for equipment in order for them to carry out different services through CWP in the community.

“Try and provide chemicals and disinfectants for cleaning toilets and things like gloves for home based care workers.”

“CWP has helped us in our gardens we now have watering cans and all the other equipment, but our problem is pests on our crops we ask CWP to provide us with pesticides like blue death and manure because all our crops are now dead we don’t know what to do anymore.”

“CWP should put more effort in to making sure that home based care workers and teacher aid receive proper equipment.”

They also report that they have gained new skills within their field of work though the work that they carry out through CWP.

“CWP has helped me a lot because I used to stay at home the whole day doing nothing but now I am able to wake up and go to work this has helped me a lot because I am now able to communicate with people and play with kids at school.”

“As a Home Base Care worker I have learned how to take care of sick people and give them love and support and also help them with their medication and advise them to visit the clinic more often so they can get help.”

“CWP helped me to understand a person who is sick and have patience to take care of that person.”

They do however also point out that there are still room for improvements in terms of creating employment opportunities and further skills development within CWP.

“Us farmers we need more training on how to control pest because they eat our plants.”

“Talk to the department of education and find ways to help teachers’ assistants to get trained.”

“When there are opportunities from government like now when they are building a new clinic. Then they should not hire new people but go to CWP and hire those people because they have all the experience.”

The beneficiaries who provide services in the community through CWP report there is a need to improve HR procedures in term of payments of stipends and developing job descriptions.

“CWP must stop hiring more staff because there are still people who have been working for more than two months and have not been paid yet, they should sort out this problem first.”

“CWP must make sure that people get paid according to the number of days worked because sometimes you find that people work for the whole month but they end up not getting the money they are entitled to.”

“We ask that when we are paid we should have a specific date for payday.”

“They should make job descriptions for us because it is hard to work around all places you end up being confused as to what job you should be doing.”

4. Conclusion

The findings clearly answer the question of how beneficiaries have been impacted by CWP. The findings show that the beneficiaries are pleased with the quality of services that are provided through the CWP programme such as home based care, cleaning of crèches and teachers assistants etc. It becomes evident that CWP has impacted and assisted beneficiaries, such as unemployed community members, sick patients, children and families, on an individual level. The impact of the CWP programme has also taken place on an institutional level through improvements of crèches and schools. The benefits can lastly be seen on community level in terms of improved infrastructure, decreased unemployment and crime, cleaner environment, improved education and provision of social support services. The conclusion is therefore that the findings paint a picture where the community has been uplifted as a whole by the CWP.

The findings also include answers to the question of how CWP can be developed and improved according to it's beneficiaries. Some answers are specific for the particular group of beneficiaries such as creating access to a garden for home based care patients. Other suggestions are represented among various beneficiaries such as skills development, training and creating further opportunities to excel for those who provide services in the community through CWP. Highlighted need for improvements in terms of the working conditions within CWP related to HR matters for the people who provide services in the community are also prominent among various beneficiaries. The beneficiaries refer to HR matters such as stipends and job descriptions. Some suggested developments would impact a particular group of beneficiaries or would improve a particular project within CWP such as suggestions made by beneficiaries of increasing the working hours for teachers assistants and home based carers. The beneficiaries also identified improvements that refer to the way CWP is structured and implemented in the community, such as improved communication between the CWP co-ordinators and the work place of the people providing services in the community and community members highlighting the need to evaluate and assess the size and the efficiency of the CWP management structures. The interviewees from the school and the interviewees who provide services in the community highlighted investments that could be made by CWP to ensure a long term impact such as providing bursaries, training and job opportunities for the beneficiaries who work through CWP.