



International  
Labour  
Office  
Geneva

**Employment Sector  
Employment Working Paper No.149**

**2013**

**The Community Work Programme:  
Building a Society that Works**

Kate Philip

Employment-  
Intensive  
Investment  
Programme

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2013  
First published 2013

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to ILO Publications (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland, or by email: [pubdroit@ilo.org](mailto:pubdroit@ilo.org). The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered with reproduction rights organizations may make copies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose. Visit <http://www.ifrro.org> to find the reproduction rights organization in your country.

---

ILO Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Philip, Kate

The community work programme : building a society that works / Kate Philip ; International Labour Office, Employment Sector. - Geneva: ILO, 2013  
(Employment working paper, ISSN: 1999-2939 ; 1999-2947 (web pdf))

International Labour Office; Employment Sector

public works / community participation / community development / part time employment / employment creation / local economic development / social service / South Africa R

04.03.7

*ILO Cataloguing in Publication Data*

---

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications and electronic products can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address, or by email: [pubvente@ilo.org](mailto:pubvente@ilo.org)

Visit our website: <http://www.ilo.org/publns>

---

Printed in Switzerland

document2

## Preface

The primary goal of the ILO is to contribute, with member States, to achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people, a goal embedded in the ILO Declaration 2008 on *Social Justice for a Fair Globalization, and*<sup>1</sup> which has now been widely adopted by the international community.

In order to support member States and the social partners to reach the goal, the ILO pursues a Decent Work Agenda which comprises four interrelated areas: Respect for fundamental worker's rights and international labour standards, employment promotion, social protection and social dialogue. Explanations of this integrated approach and related challenges are contained in a number of key documents: in those explaining and elaborating the concept of decent work<sup>2</sup>, in the Employment Policy Convention, 1964 (No. 122), and in the Global Employment Agenda.

The Global Employment Agenda was developed by the ILO through tripartite consensus of its Governing Body's Employment and Social Policy Committee. Since its adoption in 2003 it has been further articulated and made more operational and today it constitutes the basic framework through which the ILO pursues the objective of placing employment at the centre of economic and social policies.<sup>3</sup>

The Employment Sector is fully engaged in the implementation of the Global Employment Agenda, and is doing so through a large range of technical support and capacity building activities, advisory services and policy research. As part of its research and publications programme, the Employment Sector promotes knowledge-generation around key policy issues and topics conforming to the core elements of the Global Employment Agenda and the Decent Work Agenda. The Sector's publications consist of books, monographs, working papers, employment reports and policy briefs.<sup>4</sup>

The *Employment Working Papers* series is designed to disseminate the main findings of research initiatives undertaken by the various departments and programmes of the Sector. The working papers are intended to encourage exchange of ideas and to stimulate debate. The views expressed are the responsibility of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent those of the ILO.

José Manuel Salazar-Xirinachs  
Executive Director  
Employment Sector

<sup>1</sup> See [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/dgo/download/dg\\_announce\\_en.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/dgo/download/dg_announce_en.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> See the successive Reports of the Director-General to the International Labour Conference: *Decent work* (1999); *Reducing the decent work deficit: A global challenge* (2001); *Working out of poverty* (2003).

<sup>3</sup> See <http://www.ilo.org/gea>. And in particular: *Implementing the Global Employment Agenda: Employment strategies in support of decent work*, "Vision" document, ILO, 2006.

<sup>4</sup> See <http://www.ilo.org/employment>.

## Foreword

Unemployment and other employment-related problems are ongoing challenges faced by many governments and they do not occur only in times of crisis. As observed by the ILO, there was a jobs crisis before the financial crisis hit the world in 2008. This jobless growth in many areas of the economies has resulted in a problem of structural unemployment with markets unable to create employment at the scale required. This is also the case in South Africa which continues to face rampant unemployment levels, coupled with high levels of poverty and lack of skills.

ILO's actual programme work in South Africa started in 1996 introducing local labour-based road work and research. The South African Government with technical support from the ILO introduced in 2004 a strategy to provide poverty and income relief through temporary work through the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP). ILO contributed in providing standards in the infrastructure sector, determining best practices that could be replicated and developing and assisting training with the aim of increasing employability. In South Africa however, the employment-intensive approach has expanded to go beyond the traditional infrastructure and construction sector to include the environmental sector and more recently to also focus on the social sector. In addition, the Community Work Programme (CWP) – which is the focus of this article - was initiated as a multisectoral, community-driven approach.

The CWP was included as part of the EPWP Phase 2, and these South African programmes are highlighted and presented in the ILO's Innovations in Public Employment Programmes (IPEP) training material. This is an international training course which is offered internationally at the ILO's International Training Centre in Turin and regionally at the University of Cape Town, both in close collaboration with the ILO's Employment-Intensive Investment Programme (EIIP). The IPEP material and this Working Paper have benefited from the extensive experience of Dr. Kate Philip, who was key in the strategy development process on economic marginalization at the time with the South African Presidency. The development of the IPEP and associated training material has also drawn on extensive inputs from Ms. Mito Tsukamoto, Senior Specialist from the EIIP in the Employment Policy Department of the ILO.

The CWP has demonstrated how one programme can bridge the gap between social protection and employment, by offering stable and predictable supplementary income to participants through community-based approaches – identifying 'useful' activities and priorities mainly focusing on the social sector – and having significant community-level impact and responding to some of the structural nature of unemployment in South Africa. As a public employment programme, the CWP offers an innovative solution to addressing the social challenges and consequences that are created by high unemployment, through an inclusive labour-based approach which focus on multi-sectoral activities beyond infrastructure, but which nevertheless still focus on a local labour-intensive community-based participatory approach.

Terje Tessem  
Chief, Employment Intensive  
Investment Programme

Azita Berar-Awad  
Director,  
Employment Department

# Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Preface.....	iii
Foreword.....	v
Abstract.....	9
1. The Context.....	10
2. Main Features of the CWP.....	13
3. The Rationale for Regular Part-Time Work.....	15
4. The development role of Useful Work.....	16
4.1. Food security .....	17
4.2. Community Care.....	18
4.3. Support to Early Childhood Development Centres .....	20
4.4. Support to Schools.....	21
4.5. Community Safety .....	23
4.6. Recreation, arts and culture .....	24
4.7. Green Jobs in CWP.....	24
4.8. Awareness-raising as work.....	25
5. Innovation in Community Development.....	26
6. Implementation Challenges.....	29
7. Policy issues and opportunities .....	31
7.1. CWP and the interface with social protection.....	31
7.2. CWP and Local Economic Development .....	32
8. CWP and the meaning of work.....	34
9. Conclusions.....	36
References.....	37

## Abstract

In the context of a global jobs crisis, there is renewed interest in the role of public employment in providing work opportunities even where markets are unable to do so. This context has also seen a range of forms of innovation in public employment, with new forms of work and new approaches to implementation delivering different kinds of outcomes.

The Community Work Programme in South Africa (CWP) is an example of such innovation. The CWP was designed to use public employment as an instrument of community development, and uses participatory local processes to identify work that needs to be done to improve the quality of life in poor communities. This has resulted in a multi-sectoral work menu with a strong emphasis on care, food security, community safety and a range of other work activities. The inclusion of work in the social sector within a public employment programme creates new ways of strengthening social outcomes.

The CWP also differs from other public employment programmes with its focus on providing ongoing access to regular, part-time work for those who need it at local level, providing an income floor in ways that draw from lessons of social protection. This design feature is a specific response to the structural nature of unemployment in South Africa, which means that for many participants, there is no easy exit from public employment into other economic opportunities; instead, the CWP supplements as well as strengthens their other livelihood strategies.

The Community Work Programme was an outcome of a strategy process commissioned by the South African Presidency in 2007 that aimed to strengthen economic development strategies targeted at the poor. This process recognized that in a context of deep structural inequality and unemployment, strategies were needed that could enable economic participation even where markets are unable to do so. This formed part of the rationale for scaling up South Africa's existing commitments to public employment, under the umbrella of the Expanded Public Works Programme, with the CWP also designed to use public employment as an instrument of community development.

The CWP is still a relatively new programme, institutionalized in the Department of Co-operative Governance in South African since April 2010. This article examines the policy rationale for the CWP, describes its key design features and explores the forms of local innovation to which it is giving rise, in relation to the forms of work undertaken and the associated community development outcomes. It also explores some of the challenges of implementation and the policy questions to which this innovation in public employment is giving rise.

## 1. The Context

*Whenever there's something happening here in the township, it's always the CWP that's involved. (Community member in Randfontein. Vawda et al, 2013)*

The Community Work Programme (CWP) was designed to use public employment to catalyze community development; to energize participation in local development processes, to unlock new forms of community agency and to enable economic inclusion for some of South Africa's poorest and most marginalized people, in a context in which the scope for markets to do so is deeply and structurally constrained.

South Africa's unemployment levels in March 2013 were 25.2 percent, rising to 36.7 percent if discouraged workers are included (*StatsSA, 2013a*). Unlike crisis-hit countries in Europe, these high levels of unemployment have become a norm, never dropping below 20 percent since 1997. These figures are, however, national averages. Off the beaten track, away from South Africa's state-of-the-art highways, high inequality means this burden is unevenly spread, with municipalities in marginal areas having much higher official levels – such as Makhuduthamaga at 62.7 percent, Indaka at 57 percent, or Hlabisa at 52.6 percent (*StatsSA 2013b*).

The profile of unemployment further highlights the depths of the problem. Over 70 percent of the unemployed are under 34 years of age; 44 percent have never worked before, and 65.3 percent have been unemployed for more than a year (*Stats SA 2013a*). People who are out of work for long periods lose the skills and habits of work; those who have never worked may never learn them. Those who have never worked are also least likely to succeed in self-employment.

For a society, the risk is that this adds up to declining productive potential over time, developing an inter-generational dimension, compounded by poor educational outcomes, and limiting the scope for dynamism. The likelihood of this trajectory is compounded by the negative social impacts of unemployment. In focus groups with CWP participants and other community members, they highlighted the following impacts of unemployment in their communities, based on their own experience:

- Poverty in the home;
- Deterioration of health at an individual and communal level;
- Instability in their communities;
- Decline in literacy and educational levels; inadequate skills to compete in the jobs market;
- Collapse in local economic development;
- Individual and family isolation and social exclusion;
- Depression and hopelessness;
- Transactional sex and a rise in teenage pregnancy. (*Vawda et al, 2013*).

This list aligns closely with the social impacts of unemployment identified by much academic research. In South Africa, these impacts are not cushioned by any meaningful levels of social protection. Despite South Africa's strong support to unconditional cash transfers, these are targeted at people who society does not expect to work: at pensioners, children, and people with disabilities. The fact that many of the unemployed are also supported by these transfers dilutes their impacts on the target beneficiaries, and places the unemployed in dependent relationships. In the absence of mechanisms to share the societal cost of unemployment, the burden falls heavily on poor communities, with further disequalizing effects in a society already highly unequal.

In 2007, the South African Presidency commissioned a non-governmental organization (NGO) called Trade and Industrial Policy Strategies (TIPS) to review why government strategies targeting poor and marginal areas were not delivering the impacts intended, and to develop strategies to strengthen these. The outcomes of the process were approved by the South African Cabinet and included in the final report of the Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa (*AsgiSA 2009*).

This work drew attention to the ways in which deep levels of structural inequality constrain employment creation and lock poor people out of economic opportunities, impacting not only on the labour absorptiveness of the core economy but also limiting the scope for employment creation initiated from below, through the informal sector, small enterprise development or subsistence or smallholder agriculture.

The following dimensions of inequality – with their roots in South Africa's colonial and apartheid histories – combine to make inequality in SA deeply structural:

- The structure of the economy, with its high levels of centralization and vertical integration;
- Spatial inequality, and the legacy of Bantustans and apartheid cities;
- Inequality in human development (*AsgiSA 2009*).

In the early post-apartheid period, the expectation in the policy discourse was that employment creation would result largely from growth in the micro and small enterprise sector. This under-estimated the structural constraints confronting economic development in marginal contexts in South Africa.

Firstly, in South Africa, most manufactured goods in the consumption basket of poor people are mass-produced in the core economy, and widely distributed to even the most remote areas. This makes it very hard for small-scale producers to compete in these markets, and has created structural constraints on the scope for small-scale manufacturing targeting poor consumers – which is a typical entry point into markets for entrepreneurs in these communities. This has limited the growth of this sector and contributed to the bias towards often highly marginal retail activity in South Africa's informal sector (*Philip 2010*).

The second major factor limiting economic participation by the poor is the history of land expropriation, including the 1913 Land Act and later policies that created South Africa's Bantustans. These policies aimed to force black people off the land and into the labour market – and they worked. Over time, the Bantustans became de-agrarianized, with the rural population in these areas increasingly dependent on wage remittances from mining and manufacturing, and later on social grants.

The levels of de-agrarianization are striking. An average of less than 50 percent of rural households say they participate in agriculture; by March 2004, only 1.1 percent of those participating in agriculture earned their main income from it, and only 2.8 percent earned any additional income from agriculture (*Aliber, 2005*).



South Africa therefore differs from many other developing countries in these two key respects: there are real structural constraints on the scope for poor people to self-employ their way out of poverty, through enterprise activity in small scale manufacturing in particular. In addition – again unlike in many other developing countries - subsistence agriculture does not provide a form of rural safety-net when other employment opportunities contract, nor is there an easy trajectory into markets from smallholder agriculture.<sup>5</sup>

While South Africa has been attempting to tackle these structural problems, through the New Growth Path, the Industrial Policy Action Plan, and the National Development Plan, the levels of unemployment require more urgent strategies to enable economic inclusion:

*The argument is therefore for a 'first level' of intervention that aims to strengthen the incomes and assets of poor people in ways that do not depend on markets to achieve their intended impacts (although they will certainly have market effects).*

*While it will take time to overcome the structural factors, there is no time to lose in building people's sense of economic agency – of their capacity to change their material conditions through their own actions, to be productive members of their household, their community and their society. This requires that we find ways to facilitate their economic participation and scope to impact on their economic conditions even where markets do not do so (AsgiSA, April 2009).*

The main strategy proposed for enabling such economic participation was through the significant expansion of South Africa's existing commitment to public employment, with the Community Work Programme offering a new approach to doing so:

*[I]t is proposed that the concept of a minimum employment guarantee be adapted to South Africa, to target the most marginalized, in ways that ensure that those least able to find other forms of employment have access to a minimum level of regular work, building on the approach demonstrated in the Community Work Programme – an approach enabled as part of EPWP Phase 2.*

*This approach uses public employment as a catalyst for community development. 'Useful work' is prioritized at the local level, through structures such as ward committees and local development fora. This helps energize such structures, and deepens the mechanisms for local participation in development planning (AsgiSA, April 2009).*

The umbrella body for public employment programmes in South Africa is the Expanded Public Works Programme. This includes a number of different sectoral programmes, focusing on labour intensive infrastructure, on the environment, and on forms of work in the social sector – an area of significant innovation in South Africa. These programmes are, however, mainly designed to offer a short-term episode of full-time work, expected to facilitate entry into the wider labour market. As the Review of Phase One of EPWP highlighted, however, many participants exited back into poverty instead.

The CWP was designed to complement these existing initiatives, with a programme designed specifically to respond to the structural nature of unemployment, targeting the poorest and most marginal areas, and offering ongoing access to a minimum level of regular and predictable part-time work.

<sup>5</sup> For a more in depth analysis of the structural constraints on local economic development, see Philip 2010.

Crucial to the CWP model is its attempt to build a community-driven model of public employment, in which the work undertaken is identified and prioritized at community level: on the assumption that there is no shortage of work to be done in poor communities. The CWP provides an instrument intended to unlock new forms of agency in communities, providing an instrument that supports local initiative to tackle local problems. By using non-profit agencies to implement the programme, the CWP was also designed with the explicit intention of building new forms of partnership between government, civil society and communities.

The CWP has gained rapid policy prominence in South Africa; this policy support has focused increasingly on its community-driven character. In the New Growth Path, for example, the CWP is highlighted as part of strategies to build social dialogue and for its role in building new forms of community and collective action (Economic Development Department 2011).

At the 2011 July Lekgotla of the South African Cabinet, a twelve point economic plan developed by the Economic Development Department was adopted. The first point committed government to scale up the CWP to one million participants over a three-year period. If the budget to do so had been committed also, this would have effectively doubled the commitments to public employment that were already in place through the existing programmes of the Expanded Public Works Programme. An Inter-Ministerial Committee, chaired by the Deputy President, was mandated to oversee the process of scaling up the CWP.

## **2. Main Features of the CWP**

The CWP was an outcome of a strategy process commissioned by the South Africa Presidency, and was piloted in TIPS before being transferred into the Department of Co-operative Governance from April 2010. In the pilot phase, TIPS partnered with two non-profit organizations, Seriti Institute and Teba Development, to test and operationalize the CWP concept, developing a set of formalized Norms and Standards that form the essential DNA of the programme. The main elements captured in CWP's Norms and Standards are explored below

The CWP is an area-based programme, that operates through what is called a site. Sites have varied in geographical scope, but must include a minimum target of 1,000 participants. In rural areas, a site can cover several villages; in urban areas, it may cover only part of an informal settlement.

The work in the CWP must be useful work, identified and prioritized through participatory community processes. Useful work is defined as work that contributes to the public good and/or improves the quality of life in communities. Once a site is operating at a scale of a thousand participants, the work performed must have an average labour intensity of 65 percent. This labour intensity is only achievable because of the high level of social services included in CWP work. This also limits its scope to engage in infrastructure development, which avoids risks of duplicating existing infrastructure development programmes at local level.

This broad definition of useful work leaves wide scope for initiative and creativity at the local level, and results in a multi-sectoral spectrum of work activities.

CWP's overall programme budget includes an additional percentage for programme management in DCoG; this started at ten percent but has declined as a result of economies of scale as the programme has expanded. This makes the CWP a highly cost-effective form of public employment, in which the bulk of the funds reaches the pockets of participants.

It is specified in the CWP's Norms and Standards that the work must not displace existing jobs, in the public sector or otherwise. This risk is what most concerns trade unions:

that local government will use the lower wage rates in EPWP to displace existing jobs at lower cost. This would defeat the purpose of the programme, which is to augment employment, not drive down wages in existing jobs. While it certainly helps that the prohibition is written into the CWP rules, the best safeguard against such practices requires awareness of the issue in CWP Reference Committees – and trade union participation there.

While the CWP is a national government programme, institutionalized in the Department of Cooperative Governance (DCoG), it is implemented by non-profit agencies, which bring experience in participatory community development approaches. In the process, the intention is to build development capacity in civil society, creating the scope for a new form of partnership between government, civil society and communities.

Before a site begins, formal support is required from local government, often in the form of a resolution from the Mayoral Committee. The Implementing Agency is responsible for site management, including the management of funds.

At each site, a Reference Committee is constituted, to play an advisory role. Reference Committees are made up of local stakeholders, and typically include ward councilors, local government officials, civil society organizations and respected members of the local community such as school principals and clinic sisters. In the CWP site at Erasmus, in North West Province, representatives of the local taxi association also participate. The Reference Committee is the link to the wider community, and is the mechanism through which wider participatory processes are enabled.

Payment of wages is currently undertaken by Lead Agents. Each Lead Agent manages Provincial Implementing Agents in three Provinces, and Lead Agents are responsible for paying wages directly into the bank accounts of participants. This creates cashless payment systems, and creates a division of functions intended to limit risk.

The minimum wage in the CWP is set by a Ministerial Determination that covers all EPWP programmes. In 2013, the CWP paid ZAR 67 a day (approximately \$6.70). Within the CWP, workteam leaders are appointed for every 25 participants (although this varies to an extent from site to site). These team-leaders work three days a week. For every one hundred participants, co-coordinators are appointed, who work full time at a higher daily rate. From April 2012, a new pay structure in the CWP recognized semi-skilled and skilled categories of work within the CWP. This change is in recognition that not all work in the CWP is unskilled, and not all participants are unskilled either. In fact, the CWP has artisans such as plumbers, retrenched tellers from the retail sector and even some university graduates working in the programme: reflecting the complexity of unemployment in South Africa. While the facility to employ more skilled workers only covers ten percent of the CWP workforce, the participation of these workers enhances the quality of outputs in the CWP and expands the types of work that can be undertaken.

By March 2013, the CWP had a participation rate of 204,494 participants and was operating in 148 sites nationally, in rural areas, informal settlements and urban townships (DCoG 2013). The model appears well able to adapt to these different contexts. The absolute numbers of participants are still low relative to the scale of demand; the numbers are more significant, however, in terms of their impact at the local level. A CWP site covers an average of five wards (in a context in which a municipality is typically made of an average of twenty wards). At this local level, the impact of a thousand people having regular work opportunities, coupled with the impact of the work performed on the wider community represents more significant scale. Where municipalities try to share the benefit of the programme equitably across all twenty or so wards, its impacts tend to be diluted at current scale.

### 3. The Rationale for Regular Part-Time Work

The focus on regular part-time work in CWP is a response to the structural nature of unemployment in South Africa; while the work is part-time, there is no defined limit on the duration of participation, in recognition of the limited economic alternatives for participants under current conditions. The model has a number of developmental advantages, the most significant of which is that it translates into regular and predictable incomes. This creates a sustained earnings floor for participants – rather than the short-term income spike characteristic of short-term periods of full-time employment.

This approach differs from public employment programmes designed to respond to cyclical or frictional unemployment, in which participants work full-time - but for a defined period, often of quite short duration. In the debate on whether and to what extent public employment is part of social protection, the limited duration of work and/or the limited poverty impact of short-term episodes of employment have come under debate. *McCord (1995)* draws on the international literature to argue the importance of employment security and, most importantly, extended employment duration, citing *Dev (1995)*, who argues that the sustained duration of wage income is more important than the gross wage transfer, in terms of its social protection outcome.

Zane Dangor, Special Adviser to the Minister of Social Development and Chair of the CWP Steering Committee in its pilot phase, highlights how lessons from cash transfer programmes informed the design of CWP:

*There is clear evidence from cash transfer programmes that access to regular and predictable incomes of even small amounts translate into impacts on indicators such as child nutrition and school attendance. There is also evidence that access to a predictable income stream in a household enables investment in other livelihood or enterprise development activity. CWP was designed to try to optimize the chances of achieving similar effects (Interview, Johannesburg, December 2011).*

These effects were demonstrated in the Zibambele Roads programme – a precedent for CWP's part-time employment model within EPWP:

*The regular participation of all school age children in Zibambele households rose from 67% prior to participation, to 90% subsequently, while the incidence of households regularly reducing children's meal sizes due to the inability to afford food fell from 34% to 1% subsequent to public works employment. In addition, households with public works employees receiving a wage transfer reported a reduction in activities which caused them shame. The reduction of the need to beg, and the ability to perform the requisite ceremonies to mark the anniversary of family deaths were highlighted as outcomes of the programme, which indicates a reduction in the psycho-social burden of HIV/AIDS. (McCord 2005).*

In the design of the CWP, the question was therefore whether there needed to be a trade-off between the poverty impacts of regular and predictable income as demonstrated by cash transfer programmes, and the added value derived from participation in work through public employment. Rather than giving priority to one or the other, might it be possible to design a public employment programme to achieve both these outcomes instead?

Part-time work also does not displace other livelihood activities in the way full-time work might do. People who are unemployed seldom do nothing with their time; instead, they are engaged in a constant quest to find casual work or eke out a survivalist income from enterprise activity or subsistence agriculture. Yet these activities are often insufficient to lift them out of poverty, because of the structural constraints described. In many cases, access to

two days of work a week will not displace these existing activities, but will instead supplement the incomes they are able to earn – or enhance their ability to engage in complementary livelihood activities where they may not have done so before. Two days of work a week certainly does not provide a complete solution to unemployment, nor does it provide full protection from its impacts. It can however mitigate the worst effects of unemployment, in ways that enable participants to look beyond the most immediate deprivations of poverty to craft more sustainable livelihood strategies and – where possible – to access more sustainable forms of employment.

This approach has a macro-economic benefit also, because it means that to a large extent, the added value of the income earned from CWP by participants does not have to be off-set against the opportunity cost of other activities in the way that applies where a PEP involves full-time work.

The regular and predictable nature of the programme also means that the CWP is likely to have a more sustainable impact within a given local economy, because the increase in consumption is regular and predictable – rather than simply being a spike in local consumption. This creates scope for more systemic local impacts and a sustained form of stimulus into the local economy.

Finally, one of the recognized features of unemployment is the negative effect of a lack of structure in people’s lives. Regular work provides such structure. It also builds participants access to social networks and a sense of identity and purpose.

#### **Pressures on the part-time work model**

Despite the strengths of the part-time work model, there are also some tensions that arise, mainly as a result of the limited alternatives available to participants.

Firstly, many participants would prefer to work for CWP for more days a week – or full time – given the low pay, the meagre returns from other livelihood activities and the scarcity of other employment options.

At present, however, the policy debate is less about extending the days available to existing participants than about how far the coverage of the programme can be extended in order to reach more people.

The lack of economic alternatives for participants also creates other tensions at the site level. While CWP’s rules do not impose a ‘forced exit’ on participants, in recognition of the likelihood that many will simply exit back into poverty, the CWP is not an employment guarantee, nor is there scope to provide work for all who need it. The levels of participation are instead constrained by available budgets at each site. Long waiting lists create pressure for access to the work-opportunities to be shared, and for participants to be required to exit after a certain period of time. This is a real policy dilemma, with legitimate concerns for equity of access having the potential to dilute the impact of the programme on poverty, undermining the anticipated impacts of providing regular and predictable access to work.

## **4. The development role of Useful Work**

The wide definition of useful work provides communities with an instrument with which to tackle pressing local problems and social challenges. The ability to put a thousand people to work each week means that things that need to be done can get done – visibly and quickly. As participants and the wider community see change start to happen around them, that they are a part of achieving, the appetite for making things happen starts to grow. New forms of agency

take shape – often spilling beyond the confines of the work context. Despite the fact that every site is different, there are also a set of common issues that have emerged, that have become anchor programmes at many sites.

#### 4.1. Food security

Part of the policy rationale for public employment programmes is to provide participants with incomes that allow them to address the worst ravages of poverty. Often, addressing hunger is the first priority in doing so.

In the CWP, this reduction in hunger derives not only from the incomes earned by participants, it is also an outcome of the work undertaken:

*More than 45,000 home food gardens and 5000 community clinic, crèche or school gardens have been established at CWP sites around the country, with the CWP providing labour for thousands of food gardens at schools and clinics. The CWP also provides labour for food production at HIV-affected households as well as for child-headed households. This is making a huge difference to household food security as well as providing food for feeding schemes and vulnerable households. (DCoG 2011b)*

The work also includes the establishment of infrastructure that enhances local food production efforts, such as construction of water tanks, fencing, and rehabilitation of irrigation systems.

Attempts to promote food gardens in South Africa have often met with failure. Where such food gardens are linked to institutions, they usually rely on voluntary labour, from teachers, nurses or other staff. This often underestimates the amount of work involved in sustaining food production for a school full of pupils or for the network of vulnerable households supported by a clinic, with potentially negative impacts on the core work of the staff – in contexts often characterized by under-staffing. The provision of wage-labor to support these food gardens through CWP provides a framework enabling better outcomes.

There is also evidence that involvement in food security in CWP is having spillover effects in diversifying the livelihood strategies of participants. In a study of the impact of CWP on the capabilities of participants, relative to a comparable group in the community, CWP participants at the four sites surveyed were found to be significantly more likely to have initiated a food garden at their home than other community members, with 34 percent of CWP participants have food gardens, compared to 22 percent of the ‘very poor’ group into which they fall. Ninety-three percent of this food production was for own consumption. (Vawda *et al*, 2013)

*It helps because even when you don't have money for food you can come and plant and get vegetables and the kids and everyone else can eat. (Bushbuckridge CWP)*

*I am also a CWP worker, I am also working at the garden, planting different plants. The vegetables that we plant help a lot, particularly with the people that are sick that need to have the fresh and nutritious foods such as vegetables. We personally do not get anything from these gardens, but benefit by seeing our people, our sick people getting good food from our works. A lot of these people are not working and getting grants which are very low and cannot cover for most of the things they need. Umthwalume CWP.*

*I know things I didn't know about how to grow food since I've been working at CWP and I can show other people what to do also. (Bushbuckridge CWP). (Vawda *et al* 2013)*

### What to do with surplus food production in CWP?

The production of surplus food within the CWP raises some interesting implementation issues:

- Some CWP sites have produced surplus vegetables and are selling these. The CWP is not, however, designed to operate as a trading entity. Despite the apparent advantages of having the CWP cover some of its own costs, this income is small in overall terms, but the introduction of unpredictable, cash-based income streams into the CWP creates a new category of risk in management terms, with significant scope for leakage. Even where such leakage is not taking place, the scope for mistrust arises anyway.
- How are prices for such produce to be set? All the inputs and labour required are paid for in full, so price-setting bears no relation to costs. If the sale of surpluses becomes a success indicator, there will be an incentive to undercut equivalent local prices; but this would create unfair competition with local smallholder farmers competing in the same markets – including CWP participants trying to transition into this role. In fragile, marginal local economies, the CWP can become a big player. By supplying subsidized food into local markets, the CWP risks putting existing producers out of business or creating a barrier to their emergence: not a good outcome for local economic development.
- At some sites, surplus production is distributed between the CWP workers who produced it. While this enhances the poverty reduction impact of the CWP, it raises issues of equity – is such food distributed to all work teams in CWP or just to those who work in food security?
- How is it decided what constitutes a surplus? How is the conclusion reached that no further need for food exists in the vulnerable groups who are the intended beneficiaries of such food, and that what remains should be available for sale or for consumption?
- These issues are further complicated in contexts in which CWP participants volunteer their labour in the food gardens outside their two days of paid work. At certain sites, agreements have been reached that such participants receive a share of the produce in recognition of this unpaid voluntary work – and to encourage such commitment.

All of the above are a consequence of new opportunities that have arisen from positive outcomes, and certainly, sensible solutions to them can be found. The development of clear guidelines is a necessary part of the ongoing process of institutionalizing the programme and building its norms and standards

## 4.2. Community Care

*Gogo Karlina Mvhendana is 91 years old and lives in Belfast. She has been blind since 2004 and has no one to take care of her. Bohlabela CWP participants built her a one-room home with donations from people in the area. They helped her to get groceries and also linked her to an eye specialist in Hazyview. After a cataract operation she has regained sight in her right eye. “God has sent the CWP to assist me. I am so happy. I sometimes feel that I can walk to the river and go for a swim,” she says. (Lima Development, 2011)*

*Machel Nelson lives in the CWP’s Johannesburg Region G. He is an old man who can’t take care of himself or his home. ‘I would usually pay people for anything I need. I would pay to get water! No money No water. If only I had a thousand tongues to offer thanks and praises.’ (DCoG 2011b).*

The CWP has found serious deficits of care at the local level. In addition to the need for home-based care for those affected by TB and HIV/Aids and for orphans and child-headed households, there are elderly people without adequate social support – even if they may be receiving their old-age pension.

This work can include cleaning the person in need of care, changing bedclothes, cleaning the house and yard, house maintenance, washing clothes and linen, cooking food, feeding the patient, facilitating the link to social and/or health services, as well as providing labour to a household vegetable garden.

While much of the work is unskilled, CWP home based care workers are often confronted with situations that require basic medical skills. Training is crucial for these workers. In the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu Natal, for example, the Red Cross was appointed by DCoG to provide accredited training to CWP health care workers.

*It is taking us up because we are now called Health Workers. We communicate easily with nurses in hospitals. Sometimes nurses call us to come and look after people if they are too sick. We are actually growing. (Umthwalume CWP) (Vawda et al, 2013).*

For some, this skills development has created a career path out of CWP, with five of those trained by the Red Cross subsequently appointed as Community Health Workers by the Department of Health (*Lima Development 2011*).

In Bohlabelo, the matron at the clinic supervises a team of CWP participants who visit people on tuberculosis (TB) medication twice a day, and distribute vegetables from the clinic food garden – maintained by a different group of CWP workers.

*According to the matron in charge the incidence of TB declined due to CWP health intervention. The number of Multi Drug Resistant (MDR) TB cases was high, but because these patients were regularly monitored, their conditions gradually improved. (Lima Development 2011)*

CWP participants provide a link to information and treatment, extending the reach of existing systems.

*I sometimes also help out; especially those who are sickly with all these diseases that are now all over the place. I am able to start the process that will lead to the sick person being put on a treatment programme. I have already done this for a number of people. I also go out to get knowledge and information from those who have the expertise in things like how to take care of a person who is chronically ill and is at home. If I am given information then I take it back to the person who needs it. (uMthwalume CWP participant) (Vawda et al, 2013).*

Orphans and child-headed households are also a focus of care. The work may include relieving the older child of household chores and care of younger children, to enable them to go to school, to do homework and to participate in sports and recreation activities – giving them access to moments of childhood despite the heavy load they often carry.

The Zululand Centre for Sustainable Development (a local implementing agent) took such support a step further with a policy of integrating these children into the CWP as participants when they reach working age. The CWP enables economic inclusion for this most vulnerable of groups as they transition into adulthood.

Phindile Ntshangase is an orphan looking after four siblings. She is also the Njoko community garden co-coordinator in Nongoma.

*When my Mom died in 2008 I thought it was finished for my family, I felt helpless. I am really happy that now I am able to care for my siblings and myself. This has brought hope into my life. Every month I am saving R200 because I want to further my nursing studies. As long as I am employed, I will not be helpless – it is not nice for people to feel pity for you because you are an orphan (DCoG, 2011)*



The CWP has also enabled innovative forms of care – and of economic participation - for people with disabilities. In Randfontein, the CWP restored a disability centre that had fallen into disrepair because of a lack of funding for running costs. About 122 people with disabilities come to the centre each day. Many of them come with ‘two hats’. For two days a week, they come as CWP participants, in their orange uniforms, working in the vegetable garden, caring for others with disabilities, cleaning, cooking food, repairing wheelchairs and organizing group activities. Between them, they find ways to allocate the work to fit each ability and disability. For example, they have laid paving stones so that wheelchairs have access to the vegetable garden. On the other days, these same participants come as beneficiaries of the services at the centre – to be helped to wash themselves, with access to a decent meal, stimulation and good company.

### **Caring for the Care Workers**

Care work differs from other forms of work because of the need for trust and for continuity in the care relationships, in ways that have meaning beyond the context of a wage contract. In recognition of this, the selection of care workers from amongst the wider cohort of CWP participants requires care in itself. Many caregivers build relationships that extend beyond their working days in CWP.

These care relationships bring new forms of risk also, including the risks of abuse of vulnerable children - and also of vulnerable adults. In the face of these risks, continuity of care has to be kept in balance with the need for a multiplicity of care relationships in order to limit the scope for such abuse, and clear systems of supervision and oversight.

Care work also takes an emotional toll on the caregivers, with the CWP having a duty of care to participants exposed to the deeply distressing conditions in which some of the beneficiaries find themselves. This needs to include structured forms of peer support as well as access to counseling.

Ensuring quality of care also requires close links to relevant social services and health systems, with mechanisms to set minimum standards and provide quality assurance. This process is often assisted by the inclusion, for example, of clinic sisters on the Reference Committees and with government officials facilitating relevant linkages into local and provincial government structures.

### **4.3. Support to Early Childhood Development Centres**

Work at ECD Centres includes support to food production, placement of teachers’ assistants, landscaping services, repairs and maintenance to buildings, and construction of toilets. The tasks undertaken include reading stories to the children, assisting with hygiene, cooking and general maintenance. Not all sites include an ECD component. In a review of CWP’s role in support to children, Motala et al surveyed fourteen sites; five were not involved in ECD activity at all. At three of the remaining nine sites, the CWP had established a crèche or pre-school specifically to cater for the children of CWP participants, while the remaining six sites were providing support to existing ECD centres in their communities.

Motala et al explored what meaning was attached to ECD in the CWP. They found that most sites had a custodial view, with the issue of care of children often seen as a part of a wider focus on community safety. At Bulungula site, the approach was more holistic, with the CWP’s focus including nutritional support to children, parent education, health monitoring and provision of ECD services. The Implementing Agent for this site, Lima Development, has produced their own guidelines for ECD work in all the CWP sites they manage:

*The ECD programme is strongly based on the Children’s Rights Act with the main focus being on establishing safe environments for children to play in and develop through play. The idea is to establish “safe play hubs” within the communities where children can learn and*

*develop their potential as fully as possible. (Lima Development ECD Guidelines, quoted in Motala et al).*

At Dlangubo in Kwazulu-Natal, Lima Development has involved disabled CWP participants in making toys for ECD centres, shaping wood off-cuts into shapes and painting them with non-toxic dyes. The CWP has also helped erect jungle gyms in Dukuduku, Dlangubo and Mbazwane schools and crèches. Gavin Eichler of the Zululand Centre for Sustainable Development, a local implementing agent in Kwazulu Natal, explains the importance of these:

*A lot of thought goes into making a good jungle gym. Our jungle gyms are constructed in such a way that each part helps the child to develop a certain aspect of bodily-kinesthetic intelligence, for example 'balancing on the bridge', 'climbing the net', 'hand-over-hand swinging', and so on. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011p)*

Although initiated within CWP, this is an example of an activity that could potentially become a viable local enterprise. A group of participants plan to start a cooperative to supply crèches and schools in other areas.

Motala et al highlighted the need for better nutrition information to inform the menus being prepared by the CWP in these contexts. Often, such meals consist of vegetables and some form of carbohydrate, but lack protein. Obviously, the limited nutritional content of such meals is partly a resource issue.

#### **Supplementing - or duplicating - other support to Early Childhood Development Centres?**

The question that arises is how the CWP's contribution to food security relates to other forms of food subsidies - in particular, to the per-head subsidy that exists for registered ECD Centres, intended to ensure a decent meal for each child. Is CWP's involvement an opportunity to enhance the nutritional content of meals provided, or is it a *de facto* duplication of funding – allowing for diversion of existing funds?

Research by the Human Sciences Research Council found that even efficiently run ECD centres that receive the subsidy of ZAR 12 (\$1.20) per child per day found this insufficient to cover the costs of operating an ECD centre at the required quality. (HSRC 2009, quoted in Motala et al).

In addition, many local ECD facilities are not registered and do not receive any form of subsidy. CWP's involvement creates an opportunity to close this gap, with the CWP playing a role in facilitating the registration of ECD Centres, to secure access to such subsidies. This in turn brings them into the ambit of minimum quality standards.

In a multi-sectoral programme such as the CWP, the potential exists for convergence with a range of existing government programmes. Rather than duplicating existing effort, CWP has the potential to strengthen the capacity of communities to draw down on existing entitlements and support programmes - and to supplement these.

#### **4.4. Support to Schools**

In many communities, the state of education is a concern, and a range of forms of support to schools has been identified. In this context, Implementing Agent Seriti Institute developed what it calls a 'whole school programme'. While it excludes any teaching functions, the idea behind the whole school programme is 'to address every single thing that can help a school to work better'. This includes the following:

- Scholar patrols to see children to and from school safely (across streets, and at violence ‘hot spots’).
- Repair of fences, and security patrols at break, to prevent drug dealing.
- Maintenance and repairs of buildings, and cleaning of premises (costs of paint and cleaning materials are covered by the school, while labour is supplied by CWP)
- Cleaning of grounds
- Daily cleaning of toilets
- Organizing and overseeing homework classes in the afternoon.
- Helping organize sports activities every afternoon. In Phefferville, the CWP team involved in sports coaching is now accredited by the Department of Sports & Recreation and its members are competent to coach in eight different codes.
- Providing teacher aides, where class sizes are big
- Establishing and maintaining vegetable gardens, and planting trees and doing other landscaping at every school
- Organizing recycling at school with school’s own refuse, and using this to also raise awareness of the issue among households of learners
- Feeding schemes: where schools are nodes of care for support of vulnerable children
- Creating or maintaining sports and play facilities.
- Helping maintain schools as alcohol free zones and weapons free zones.
- Responding to other requests from the School Governing Board through the principal. *(Seriti Institute 2011)*

By contrast, Implementing Agent Teba Development has focused on placing education assistants in schools. The potential scale of demand for this is illustrated by the experience at Bohlabelo, where 550 education assistants were allocated to 30 secondary schools, one school for disabled, 48 primary schools and 10 crèches. All these education assistants were unemployed matriculants.

*There is now less stress for the teachers and therefore many of the schools have improved their results. We have found that many of the schools also want more assistants. The education sector of the CWP is very effective because it offloads work from the teachers so that they can focus on their teaching. The educational assistants also help the teachers to control the students because there can be 86 students per class which is difficult to handle for one teacher. (Dumisani Mdhuli, CWP Facilitator, Bushbuckridge, interviewed by Megan Cochrane).*

These assistants assist in the classroom, handing out and collecting exercises, they do administrative work, work in libraries where these exist, photocopying, coaching extramural activities, and running homework classes. They also help with some of the more unskilled tasks undertaken by teachers: helping to dish out food at lunchtime, fetching water for children to wash their hands before eating and after going to the toilet – and escorting younger children across busy roads after school.

A study by the Centre for Democratizing Education (CDE) in ten schools in four Provinces where CWP is involved in public primary schools found that the work CWP is doing ‘is contributing significantly to making public primary schools in the study safer, cleaner, more attractive and productive. This enhances the learning environment at schools.’ *(CDE 2013).*

### **Pfefferville – a kickstart for change**

Pfefferville is arguably the Eastern Cape's poorest township, with high levels of unemployment, alcohol abuse and crime. The CWP at Pfefferville is involved in a range of support activities at schools but it is the focus on sports coaching that sets Pfefferville apart.

In addition to soccer, the CWP also coaches netball, rugby, cricket, and gumboot dancing. "And we want to start a programme of indigenous games like klip-klippie" says Clinton Morrow, the CWP supervisor who is in charge of the sports programme...But soccer is the big game and the CWP are coaching at seven schools, including organizing friendly matches and a winter league for boys and girls. (TIPS Case Study Series, 2011k).

## **4.5. Community Safety**

*[We] now notice the level of crime decreasing. So as far as I am concerned, the CWP and the patrollers are doing a fine job and must never stop. Randfontein; Non-CWP Member of the community. (Vawda et al, 2013)*

At the CWP's first site in Munsieville, one of the work priorities identified was to address violence against women. Important as the issue no doubt is, how could it be converted into a set of work tasks? This is what they did in Munsieville:

- The deployment of CWP community safety guards at known rape hotspots
- The clearing of long grass and bushes on walkways to taxi ranks and other community facilities, also known as places of vulnerability for muggings and rapes.
- The brokering of agreements with local shebeens, to close earlier.

The latter is an example also of the kind of legitimacy that the CWP has to address such issues with a level of social mandate.

Community mapping processes often served to highlight how underserved some communities are by more formal policing. In Tkakastad, for example, there is no police station. CWP reintroduced the community policing forum, and with support from the police, CWP participants undertake patrols.

In Manenberg, in Cape Town, CWP transformed a dumping site that was a crime hotspot into a recreational community park now referred to as a 'peace garden'. In Bokfontein, a disused quarry in which two children had drowned was filled in and similarly converted into a public recreational space.

For poor communities, breaking the cycle of criminality is also a challenge. Manenberg, in the Western Cape, is notorious for its gang wars and drugs. For this reason, the CWP site there took the initiative to try to break the cycle of criminality by using the CWP to reintegrate prisoners back into the community when they come out of jail. They initiated a partnership with the Department of Correctional Services, through which offenders from the area who have served their time join the CWP. For the first month, this is as part of community service, after which an assessment is made by the CWP and if they have shown an appropriate level of commitment, they are absorbed as participants of the programme.

#### 4.6. Recreation, arts and culture

Although the work differs, there is a close conceptual link between community safety and the organization of youth recreation and cultural activities. These are designed to keep the youth off the street and out of trouble, as well as to create public spaces for families and the community to relax, creating green spaces and parks, and planting and maintaining shade trees and fruit trees. Implementing Agency Seriti Institute has, for example, planted over 6,000 trees at the sites for which it is responsible (Andersson, 2013b).

*Apart from the more predictable emphasis on the material infrastructure of the community – a road, piped water – the Bokfontein community values a pleasant public space. Their new road is lined with young trees that will provide shade and soften the harsh impression made by the broken stone and glaring heat of the road surface. The new park provides a wide green space for a marginal and impoverished community ‘to enjoy nature’, in Mohlala’s words, like any other more prosperous community. (Langa and Von Holdt 2010).*

*We are happy that they’ve planted trees on the side of Ralerata Road; all the way to the corner with the traffic lights. And what we love about trees is that they act as a windbreak, making sure that our houses are not damaged when there are strong winds. Also, when it’s hot, people are able to find relief from the shade under the trees. (Randfontein CWP). (Vawda et al)*

Another strategy for transforming people’s living environment is through public art, with murals and mosaics painted on vacant walls, at taxi ranks, schools and other public facilities.

#### 4.7. Green Jobs in CWP

Many sites include an environmental component, but a partnership with the Department of Water Affairs as part of the Hartebeespoort Dam Remediation Programme provided a more formal engagement with the scope for environmental work in the CWP.

*People who live in Diepsloot, Bez Valley, Alexandra, Munsieville and Ivory Park all live near the Jukskei River. Instead of the scenic beauty associated with rivers, this one is filthy. In some places it looks as if a garbage truck dumped its contents into the river: plastic bags float around. Then there are the cold drink bottles, milk cartons, soiled nappies, dead animals, animal and human excrement and even worse. Sometimes, sadly, dead babies are thrown into the river....*

*When the summer rains arrive, this debris floats down the river. The Jukskei is one of four rivers flowing into the Hartebeespoort Dam, a popular tourist attraction – and a vital source of drinking water for most of Gauteng Province and North West Province. However the dam is battling the effects of pollution flowing in from the rivers, as well as alien invader plants, hyacinth and Caribbean weed. When these plants cover the surface of the dam, the oxygen level in the water decreases. This lack of oxygen, combined with the pollution, kills the fish and other living creatures in the dam. It destroys the ecosystem. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011e).*

The CWP involved 2,904 people in the river cleaning programme. More than sixty kilometres of river banks were cleaned, 2035 tons of debris was removed, and 731 tons of hyacinth and Caribbean weed were removed. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011e).

In the process, the CWP developed significant levels of awareness of the impact of pollution, and the role of water in life amongst participants as well as at local schools and in the community.

#### 4.8. Awareness-raising as work

The CWP site in Munsieville turned the social challenge of violence against women into a set of work tasks. Events in the CWP site in Alexandra Township (known as Alex) in Johannesburg illustrated that violence against women is not just an external threat for participants, but one that is much closer to home. A CWP participant was found gruesomely hacked to death by her husband:

*The woman's eyes were gouged out, her lips and nose cut, her throat slit, and her intestines strewn all over her injured face. The CWP co-coordinator, who alerted people to the scene, found her 10 year old child trying to push back the intestines into his mother's lifeless body. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011h).*

This horrific case of domestic violence cast the spotlight onto an issue that had remained unspoken until then: the extent to which women in Alex were coming to work in the CWP with injuries sustained at home. There was a day when 12 beatings, 2 hospitalizations and one near death were reported in the CWP, and the site has had three cases of women who have endured serious injuries and broken bones during domestic attacks. Some of the perpetrators are also CWP participants, thrusting the CWP co-coordinators into unanticipated and often difficult roles. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011h).

After the murder, CWP participants marched to the Wynberg court in protest at violence against women, and the CWP in Alex initiated a campaign called '2day he bought her flowers'. The campaign uses this horrifying story in various ways to get its message across: "Give her flowers because you love her, not for her funeral".

In Alex, the CWP is involved in all dimensions of the issue of violence against women, as an issue affecting participants, as an issue around which work tasks have been developed, as a campaign issue in which the CWP Reference Committee and CWP site management have taken a leading role, and in which participants are involved outside the context of their work in CWP also.

Another example from Alex, amongst many other sites, is the role of CWP in Phuza Wize, a campaign of the Department of Social Development focusing on the use and misuse of alcohol. In Alex, the CWP hosts a radio show on the topic that reaches more than 1.2 million people through Alex FM. (TIPS Case Study Series 2011h).

Phuza Wize is a government programme; but its content challenges current social practices. Similarly, CWP's role in awareness-raising on issues of HIV/Aids has at times entailed a level of activist courage in the face of stigma at the local level – despite the strong policy support such processes now have from the Department of Health.

Caregivers in the CWP receive intensive exposure to the issues of HIV/Aids and TB in all their dimensions, they play a vital role in their CWP work in conveying information on these diseases and on their treatment, and this impacts on their own lives also - the messages they convey are not confined to their work in the CWP.

This awareness-raising dimension relates to many of the work areas of the CWP across a spectrum of issues, with participants becoming advocates of issues as diverse as organic farming methods, the threat of contaminated water supplies, the advantages of recycling, people's rights to social grants, and many more current and community development issues: with raised awareness amongst participants an outcome of the work - with some innovative methodologies employed also.

This makes the CWP a potential nervous system for the transmission of new ideas, information and practices into the community, and a resource for government in doing so. All

of these issues need more than local government support to gain traction in communities; the NGO sector has also struggled to take many of these messages to community level.

## 5. Innovation in Community Development

*The community work model's importance lies not only in its scalability, but also in the way social mobilization is made integral to the rollout process, using non-profit agencies to implement the programme and creating new forms of partnership between government, civil society and communities.*

*The type of public employment that the commission advocates is not just income transfer in disguise. It is about inculcating a new mindset that empowers people to contribute to their communities. (National Planning Commission 2011: 344).*

The inception of a new CWP site requires a resolution of support from the Mayoral Committee or other appropriate structure of the local council, and initial community meetings and engagements are facilitated by these local structures. How the CWP is introduced into a community sets the framework for how it becomes part of the life of that community.

In the pilot phase, different approaches to community development were tested, developed and adapted in ways that allowed the CWP to be operationalized in diverse community contexts. This included the use of Participatory Rural Appraisal methodologies, the development of Community Mapping techniques, and the adaptation of a methodology called the Organization Workshop.

The Organization Workshop (OW) is an action-learning method for large group capacitation in economic and social development. This organizational training approach was developed in Latin America in the 1960s and adapted to southern Africa over the last twenty years. It was developed by Brazilian sociologist Clodomir Santos de Moraes, who argues that it is aimed at helping 'excluded' and 'hard-to-reach' citizens who are marginalized through existing economic structures. (Langa and Von Holdt 2011). The OW is designed to involve large numbers of people in an extended action learning process that lasts for about a month and is undertaken within a community. The largest OW held in South Africa involved four hundred people.

*It is a real, practical exercise to facilitate the development of organizational consciousness in a social group that needs to act as an enterprise i.e. in an organized manner. The workshop design is based upon locally identified problems that cannot be tackled by an individual or small group. When a community is prepared to contribute with labour to the solution of some of their most pressing problems, the Organization Workshop provides a framework that enables learning about organization while participants engage in productive work. (Interview with Gavin Andersson, Johannesburg, November 2011)*

These features of the Organization Workshop (OW) build the initial capacities required to operationalize the CWP at community level and the approach was adapted to the CWP context by Seriti Institute. While the focus of the methodology is on building work organization skills, it also integrates a strong focus on the social history of the community and the social issues it confronts.

One of the first sites where this approach was used as part of the inception of a CWP site was in a small peri-urban informal settlement called Bokfontein. In 2010, communities on either side of Bokfontein were engulfed in xenophobic violence and/or service delivery protests. Despite a history of forced evictions, high levels of poverty, poor service delivery, and high numbers of foreign residents, Bokfontein was largely untouched by such violence.

For this reason, it was included in a study of these trends in eight communities, by Langa and Von Holdt.

*In the Bokfontein case, what made the CWP/OW intervention so powerful was its ability to simultaneously address the collective trauma of the community and its poverty and marginalization. All the participants interviewed in this research agreed that development would not have been possible in Bokfontein if people had not been assisted collectively through the OW to deal with their anger and the effects of collective trauma resulting from forced removals and intra-community violence. It was evident that the OW increased social cohesion, strengthening local community leadership and a collective approach to problem solving. This case suggests that developmental initiatives that only address socio-economic issues, while neglecting socio-psychological issues, are unlikely to achieve great success and may only reproduce lines of conflict in communities.*

*However, this case study also shows that real collective healing needs to go beyond the psychosocial needs of the community to address their socio-economic needs. The employment and social capital provided by CWP projects has broken the cycle of violence and crime, improved household livelihoods, and provided public goods and services that are actively reshaping the community, materially and symbolically. It is unlikely that, on its own, the attitude-changing processes of the OW would be able to make a lasting impact on the community. Implemented together, though, OW and CWP have empowered this community both psychologically and economically to believe that they can create opportunities and contribute meaningfully to their own process of reconstruction and community development. In this way, the Bokfontein community has created a collective narrative of dealing with past traumas and transforming them into a new narrative about the future and about collective agency to make a different future. (Langa and Von Holdt 2011)*

Powerful as this form of community development proved to be, its intensive nature made it difficult to roll out at every site. In a review of the methodology, it was recommended that priority be given to using it in 'the most fractured' communities (Marock 2010).

Community Mapping provides a different kind of participatory process that enables the identification of a work agenda. Gavin Andersson of Seriti Institute describes how it is used:

*Community Mapping means as a first step "Mapping the Past" of the community; constructing a timeline of events, ideas and personalities that shaped the community and made it what it is today. The second step is to look at the physical facilities and resources in the community – churches, sports fields, businesses, taxi ranks, spaza shops, crèches, cemeteries, potential agricultural land and areas unsuitable for agriculture, informal settlements and other housing, water supply points, schools, clinics and other social infrastructure, and areas identified as problem areas ('hot spots' for crime, sites of environmental degradation, areas dangerous for children etc).*

*Then there is a focus on the way the community is divided into wards, and the various kinds of organization present in the community, including the presence of traditional leaders and healers. The third step is to reflect on the Strengths for the community and the reasons these are strengths; under-utilized resources, strong leaders or vibrant organizations, beneficial customs and so on.*

*The fourth step is to identify community Challenges like crime, drug abuse, high unemployment, orphans, high levels of teenage pregnancy and others. A fifth step is then undertaken, to identify specific areas of interest amongst the team in addressing the challenges. The sub-teams tasked with each of the identified challenges then undertake further research into it, looking at the extent of the problem, its causes, champions in tackling it, and the various kinds of strategies that can be used to address it including the ways in which existing strengths in the community could be applied. After sharing this detailed research the Team works together to "Imagine the Future" once they have created the kind of community*



*they want to live in. This last step in the community mapping process is very detailed and leads to proposals about immediate actions. (Andersson 2013a).*

Many of the forms of work that are prioritized at site level are designed to address social challenges, and are ingredients of a community development agenda. So, tackling hunger, the care agenda, strengthening community institutions such as clinics, crèches and schools, community safety, youth recreation and transforming public spaces – these work outcomes all contribute in different ways to building more resilient communities.

Both participation in CWP and the outreach effects of the work of CWP reach some of the most vulnerable and marginalized groupings and create access into networks of information and support. CWP also provides a platform for wider information dissemination.

*At a CWP site, 1,000 people or more come together in one place each week to be assigned to their work. This has become a magnet for civil society organizations who want to get their message out, make people aware of what they are doing, It's a simple thing, but it has made a difference to people's access to information. Government departments are using this also; people become more aware of their rights and what is happening. (Interview, Sibusiso Mkhize, Seriti Institute)*

In addition, CWP provides a platform that enables and unlocks wider community initiative as well as investment of their own resources:

*Last December, Matatiele had a Brighter Christmas campaign, to paint homes of those elderly who live alone – brightening their houses. Paint was donated by community members and the participants did the work. This made such an impact the site plans to repeat it this year. (Interview, Caroline O'Reilly, Teba Development).*

In Vawda et al, they find that participants in the CWP are more likely to participate in voluntary activity and to contribute their own resources to help others than other members of the community. (Vawda et al, 2013).

New forms of organization have also been catalyzed, with evidence of increased participation in savings schemes and stokvels (a local form of groups savings). In Sterkspruit, for example, 480 participants and twenty coordinators initiated a stokvel to which each member contributes R100 (\$10) on a monthly basis for a year. The participants have also established a burial scheme where members contribute R20 (\$2) per person (Kganya-Ka-Kitso, 2011).

While many of these outcomes emerge as a consequence of design features of the CWP model, there is nevertheless also a need and an opportunity to enhance such outcomes with the development of tools and approaches that institutionalize community development approaches within the programme, and at different stages of the lifecycle of a site. So, while the use of community development approaches as part of site inception is relatively well-developed, there is a need for tools that enable participatory approaches to processes such as monitoring and evaluation.

An example of such a tool is the mapping project developed by TIPS. This uses Geographic Information Systems (GIS) to map sites, providing a visual tool that can contribute to community mapping, as well as to participatory monitoring and evaluation. After mapping the geographical features of a site, this approach uses GIS mapping to capture the activities and outputs of a site on the map, with the facility to link photographs of 'before' and 'after' to each of these, with notes that allow a site to capture its own history in the making – and record performance indicators. This approach was piloted at four sites; young matriculants within the CWP were selected and trained to capture and input the data. It provides a highly visual basis for community report-back and engagement. It also provides an opportunity for

more skilled work for participants within CWP. The outcomes of the TIPS GIS Mapping can be seen at [www.tipsgis.com](http://www.tipsgis.com).

Ironically, despite the many forms of innovation and initiative at local level, and despite the primacy given to community development in the CWP concept and as part of its policy rationale, one of the weaknesses identified in an Institutional Review commissioned by the CWP Steering Committee is that such approaches have not been institutionalized in the model effectively enough. Too much latitude has been given to the initiative of Implementing Agencies in this regard, without sufficient guidelines on minimum standards, benchmarks or common approaches. This is compounded by the fact that community development is not a separate line-item in the budget, making it effectively an unfunded mandate. This results in uneven development across sites. For some Implementing Agencies, ongoing innovation in this area is integral to their approach; for others that is not the case.

Following the Institutional Review, DCoG has taken steps to remedy this gap, as an important part of the ongoing process of deepening and strengthening the model. (*Interview with Hassen Mohamed, Co-Chair of the CWP Steering Committee, May 2013*).

## 6. Implementation Challenges

The outcomes of the CWP at community level depend on effective implementation, and – as can be expected in a new programme that is scaling up quickly – there are implementation challenges.

A feature of the CWP was that it was piloted outside of government, with donor funding. What differentiates it from many such pilot projects is that it then became a government programme, funded from the budget, and institutionalized in the Department of Co-operative Governance from April 2010. This transition was due in no small part to the fact that CWP was an outcome of a strategy process initiated by the Presidency, and strategic oversight of the pilot process was provided by a Steering Committee comprising the Presidency and the Department of Social Development. This assisted this fledgling programme to get high levels of policy support.

Despite this, however, the process of transitioning into government systems was not an easy one, not least because it was premised on getting such systems to work in different ways. A consistent theme in the policy documents that make reference to CWP is that it was expected to build ‘new forms of partnership between government, civil society, and communities’ (*NPC, 2011*), and that its success depended on ‘new forms of co-operative governance.’ (*IMC, April 2012*)

A key part of the new partnership envisaged was the role of non-profit organizations in implementation, and an approach that was responsive to community needs and that enabled new forms of social mobilization and community agency.

The policy support for such processes derived from recognition that government had become locked into a model of development in which the role of government is ‘to deliver’: leaving communities with little role but to protest when delivery does not happen. While the need to unlock greater participation and new forms of agency at community level was articulated at a high level, translating this into new forms of practice across three spheres of government was to prove more difficult – coupled with the need for new forms of organizational practice in communities themselves.

The CWP also had to align with a range of existing institutions, and required ‘a new form of co-operative governance’:

The location of the programme in DCoG was motivated by the following:

- *To ensure effective alignment with the integrated development planning processes*
- *To facilitate strong partnerships with ward structures and local government*
- *To enable the development of a new form of co-operative governance, in which a range of partner departments would continue to play a role in the strategic oversight of the programme, institutionalized through the Steering Committee. (IMC, April 2012)*

In this concept of co-operative governance, DCoG is the custodian of a programme that has wider ownership within government. This is necessary because of the multi-sectoral nature of the programme. In each of the areas in which work is initiated in CWP, government departments or Provinces typically have existing mandates, quality standards and programmes – whether in relation to promoting food security, early childhood development, provision of care, schools support or any of the other areas in which CWP initiates work.

The initiative to connect into these existing systems comes in the first instance from the bottom up, at local levels: through agreements reached between the CWP and the clinics, the schools, the agricultural extension workers or social workers. Government officials – local, provincial and national - have a key role to play in enabling these partnerships, to enable convergence between work initiated from below in CWP and wider policies and programmes. The CWP in turn assists government in the delivery process by drawing down on existing resources, in ways that give local expression to wider initiatives and support integrated development at the local level, potentially providing a new platform to support delivery.

Such processes are however enhanced and simplified where more formal partnerships are entered into between government departments at national level and set out standard terms of engagement in relation to the most common programmes.

In this context, the transition into government involved crafting an appropriate interface with multiple structures, coupled with adaptation in the roles of some roleplayers, and new roles for others. New ways of doing things challenge existing ways of doing things. Sometimes this generates resistance; even where it doesn't, the process of change involves some trial and error.

Not surprisingly therefore, the process of institutionalizing the CWP in government was complex and challenging, and has involved periods of high contestation over aspects of the model. The existence of an Inter-Ministerial Committee chaired by the Deputy President and tasked with overseeing the process of scaling up the CWP has however ensured a level of consistency in asserting the policy priorities the CWP was designed to meet.

The most negative consequences of the difficulties of institutional transitions are however felt on the ground. A key design feature of the CWP is its emphasis on providing 'regular and predictable' work. To achieve the anticipated impacts of this, both work and the payment for work need to be regular and predictable. One of the institutional challenges has proved to be the development of efficient payment systems: not least because DCoG's systems were never designed to manage large-scale wage payments; doing so was outside the comfort zone and experience of some of the officials required to authorize such payments.

In 2011, a series of delays in the payments due to workers seriously destabilized the programme on the ground, with toyi-toying<sup>6</sup> the inevitable result. In 2012, there were instances of lengthy arrears in payments to Implementing Agents. This included payment for

<sup>6</sup> Toyi toyi is a traditional South African dance often used in political protest to an event.

tools, materials, safety gear and other non-wage costs. In practice, this meant sites were operating with inadequate tools and materials, shortages of safety gear, and an inability to contract in technical support or provide training. While at one level, this is a bureaucratic constraint, and may be transient, its potential to erode the quality of work – as well as morale at site level – is significant.

Another important implementation risk is that the more successful the CWP is at local level, the greater the risk of attempts at capture and patronage, both inside and outside the state. This includes, for example, risks in relation to the selection of participants. Perceptions of patronage certainly already exist in some contexts.

*The nice thing is that the government brought the Community Work Programme Company but what's bad about it is that they hire and help their relatives. (Umthwalume community member) (Vawda et al).*

Unless measures to address such risks are institutionalized and enforced, this has the potential to undermine the programme's development impacts. Linked to this are the risks of corruption that require ongoing vigilance.

Finally, in a context of significant pressure to scale up, effective community development processes can end up taking a back seat to achieving 'the numbers'; also that the necessary capacities to run the programme effectively at grassroots level are not available on a wide enough scale, and the quality of outputs declines over time.

An Institutional Review of the CWP commissioned by the Steering Committee has identified these and other issues, and the CWP team in DCoG is working to address them. While only time will tell if they can successfully navigate their way through these institutional challenges, these did not stop the programme from continuing to grow rapidly: doubling in size and exceeding its participation rate targets in 2012/13.

## **7. Policy issues and opportunities**

### **7.1. CWP and the interface with social protection**

There is some recognition now in the International Labour Organization (ILO) that public employment programmes can be a key instrument contributing to the social protection floor, although there has been debate in the past that in order for PEPs to be considered as social protection they must be about regular and predictable income transfer, with participation an entitlement – as in the case of an employment guarantee (*see Liew Kie Song et al for more discussion on this issue*).

Whether the CWP is considered a part of social protection or not, there are nevertheless a range of ways in which it impacts and interfaces with social protection concerns. At the most obvious level, the CWP is an intervention that contributes to addressing South Africa's major social protection gap – the lack of support for the vast majority of unemployed adults who are willing and able to work. The scale of CWP's contribution in this regard will depend on the scale to which the programme goes.

In the context of deep structural unemployment, a key design feature of the CWP also draws from lessons of social protection, to place the emphasis on providing regular and predictable part-time work to participants, to ensure a sustained contribution to an income floor.

In the debate on whether PEPs are part of social protection, one of the critiques of public employment programmes (PEPS) is that this form of intervention is inaccessible to labour-

stressed households. This is an important issue in the face of an Aids epidemic such as South Africa has faced (McCord 2005). The CWP illustrates, however, that there is scope for public employment programmes to play a different kind of role than perhaps assumed in this regard, in a context in which the provision of labour to support labour-stressed households has become part of the work of the programme.

*In HIV-affected households, it is not just the labour of the person who is ill that is withdrawn from the households' labour supply, but the labour of their caregivers also. The CWP's provision of labour to such households to maintain food security can curtail the downward spiral into chronic poverty - and its inter-generational effects. The use of CWP to relieve some of the burden of care from care-givers can also enable these caregivers to maintain some level of economic engagement – including participation in the CWP itself - to bring income into the household. The CWP therefore provides multiple forms of support to labour-stressed households. (O'Brien 2011).*

This introduces a new dimension to the debate: with PEPs contributing to supporting labour stressed households. At the same time, the part-time nature of work in the CWP, coupled with its local character, means that the design of the CWP potentially enables economic participation by such households, in a form that guarantees an income return, in a context in which other forms of economic participation are extremely constrained: many informal livelihood activities offer very limited certainty in terms of the economic returns to effort. The uncertainty of such returns disincentivizes economic participation in a context in which labour is in short supply. CWP has the potential to change this cost/benefit equation.

The emphasis on care in CWP provides an alternative to the reliance on voluntarism in addressing gaps in care, and also offers a new instrument to tackle certain dimensions of the burden of unpaid care work in society. This burden falls primarily on women, with significant impacts on their ability to engage in livelihood activity or participate in the labour force, tying them to the home. The societal reliance on unpaid care work as part of social reproduction is widely recognized as a significant factor impacting on gender inequality and on the opportunities open to women. These pressures have heightened in the face of the HIV/Aids epidemic, and have been compounded in many countries by cuts in social services also. (Budlender 2012)

### **Strengthening the social content of social protection?**

At present, the debate on social protection tends to focus on the role of cash transfers of some kind. Important as these are, there is a risk that the concept of social protection becomes reduced to a monetary transfer. What is the social content of social protection?

Arguably, the approach to care in CWP strengthens the inter-personal dimension of care within communities, where old people and orphans and others in need have names and histories and where part of care involves taking the time to engage with their daily experience and their specific needs. This human dimension of care is a vital complementary dimension to other forms of social protection in such instances.

## **7.2. CWP and Local Economic Development**

The incomes earned through CWP act as a significant injection of resources into poor local economies, providing a form of stimulus that thickens local markets and trickles up into the wider economy from below. The fact that the programme is ongoing and the incomes are regular also enhances the scope for this to support local enterprise development, because it provides a predictable and ongoing increase in local consumption spending.

Local procurement by the CWP, such as for tools or materials, can also strengthen the local economy and can create economies of scale locally that benefit local producers. For example, instead of developing an in-house seedling nursery to supply its needs, CWP Implementing Agent Teba Development assisted a local entrepreneur to establish such a nursery. The sustained demand for seedlings from the CWP creates economies of scale that make this enterprise viable, at the same time creating a source of seedling supply in the wider community – where no such local supply had previously existed.

Access to income, coupled with work experience and the skills derived from work in CWP can also strengthen other livelihood activities – marginal as these often are:

*I say, being self-employed is good because work is scarce these days, so we cannot just sit and say the government will give us work, so at least so that the kids can have food, you can sell paraffin, crisps and tomatoes.(Randfontein CWP)*

*Even when I'm selling chips, I wish that I can succeed. That small thing that I'm doing to support my salary from CWP. (Umthwalume CWP)*

*I pick up bottles and sell them and get that little bit. It's okay, and at times other women join in with me. (Randfontein CWP).*

*Like chicken feet we sell that also. At the end of the day you have R30 and the kids have bread and pocket money for school the next day.' Moderator: Do these things make a difference? 'More than the word, it makes a difference.' (Randfontein CWP),*

*(Vawda et al, 2013).*

There are a range of ways in which CWP can support and enhance these nascent forms of economic participation. In Bokfontein, the CWP provided technical support to an initiative by participants to establish a consumer co-operative. In sites such as Erasmus, CWP has been involved in waste recycling as part of its work; in the process, demonstrating the scope to generate an income from such activity. While this opportunity existed before the CWP became involved, it took the CWP's involvement to demonstrate the possibility and absorb the risks of starting something new.

This places the CWP in a position to innovate and to incubate income generating activities and enterprise activities, in ways that remove initial risk, allow for experimentation and skills development. The jungle gyms in Dukuduku provide a good example of this. Key to this approach is the idea that the CWP's involvement would only be at the development stage, with the intention of 'spinning off' such activities as enterprise activities as their viability becomes apparent.

### **CWP and enterprise development: risks and opportunities**

If CWP incubates enterprise activities, then at what point does the CWP 'spin off' such enterprise activities, and who benefits from the opportunity to leverage private gain off the CWP's initial investment? While these gains may seem to be inconsequential at a macro level, with the investment seen simply as an investment in local development, this becomes an area of potential contestation, conflict and patronage within the CWP, in a context of scarce resources. Incubation of enterprise activity within the CWP also requires a different skills set at a management level.

In addition, if the CWP were to subsidize its own engagement in enterprise activity at any scale, this could make it impossible for others to compete, creating barriers to sustainable enterprise development and damaging the local economy.

The Norms and Standards of the CWP include a prohibition on the CWP being used to subsidize enterprise activity, but often the dividing line is a thin one.

For example, making CWP tools available for participants to use outside of CWP's working hours may seem like a small and harmless contribution to wider livelihoods support, but the CWP has faced pressures to contribute to the labour costs of enterprise activity outside of the CWP in ways that allow for private capture of the CWP resource.

In one site, for example, a conflict situation arose when the leader of a local co-op registered a complaint with DCoG that the CWP was not allowing the co-op to use the CWP tools, and nor was the CWP providing free labour to the co-op. The expectation that CWP should do so reflects the kinds of misconceptions about the role of CWP that can arise. In addition, a visit to the co-op illustrated that it was seamlessly integrated into a private business operation run by the complainant, which included a bottle store, with little evident separation of cash flows. While there are many ways the CWP can support local enterprise development, this cannot include providing direct subsidies to the operating costs of private enterprise activities.

The challenge is to find ways to optimize the scope for the CWP to contribute to strengthening complementary income generating strategies amongst participants and to the creation of sustainable local enterprises: in ways that avoid these risks.

## 8. CWP and the meaning of work

In South Africa, it is typical to see signs on the gates of factories and shops that say: 'No jobs', turning away prospective applicants. In his description of what CWP means in Bokfontein, CWP Co-coordinator King George Mohlala said:

*In the CWP, there is no sign on the gate that says 'no jobs here'. Instead, we will have a sign on the gate that says: 'Jobs are here! We need people!'*

Part of the corrosive impact of unemployment is the sense it creates that people are surplus to the needs of society: they are not needed. In the CWP, people *are* needed; and because work is decided by communities, the work performed is needed by the community, adding to the validation participants get from the work performed.

An indicator that work in the CWP has meaning beyond the wage that is earned comes from the number of instances in which CWP workers come to work on a volunteer basis outside of their own working hours, such as at the vegetable gardens in Randfontein:

*Even on the days they are not working, many participants will put on their uniform and leave the house early in the morning, as if to signal to their neighbours that 'I am working, I am somebody, I have somewhere I need to be'. And they come here and work in the fields alongside those whose turn it is to work in CWP.'* (Interview Randfontein Co-coordinator, June 2011)

In the same way that the impacts of unemployment go far beyond just the loss of income, participation in work impacts on people's lives at multiple levels: providing structure to their weeks, social interaction, access to networks and information, work experience, and new skills and competencies.

This builds their sense of self-worth, which in turn reduces the incidence of anti-social behaviour, with impacts also on their families and the wider community:

*I'm fine with my job and it's better than being at home ....even your mind as well, you don't get tempted to do crime because you spend a lot of your time working and not thinking other things. (Bushbuckridge CWP)*

*It is good to have a job, it protects one from having anger in her heart and they start thinking bad things, like if I can rob someone, yet when you are working, you become loving, even at home you can support the kids at home. (Randfontein CWP).*

*There's no domestic violence at home, because it's a lack of money that causes it most of the time. (Randfontein CWP)*

*For instance, I cannot go to work drunk, I have to respect my job by not drinking when going to work, even if I drink, I will drink Saturday and Sunday, but not during the week. (Randfontein CWP).*

*It has changed my life in a big way, I mean there are STI, HIV and all those diseases, you know sometimes you risk your life and sleep with someone that you don't love, just so he can give you money. Since I started getting a job knowing that I get something at the end of the month, that stopped. (Randfontein CWP).*

*(Vawda et al, 2013)*

Langa and von Holdt argue that part of the meaning derived from work in the CWP is also amplified because the work is 'decommodified':

*A striking feature of the work provided by CWP – despite its part-time and low-wage character – is that it entails the decommodification of labour and focuses on providing public goods as defined by the community itself. ... CWP workers emphasized that the work differs from employment on nearby farms because it is work for the community, and this makes them feel differently about the work as well – they know it has an intrinsic value for the community, and they therefore do not resent the low wages in the way they would if they were working for a private employer. (Langa and Von Holdt 2011).*

In Vawda et al's study on the impacts of participation in CWP on the capabilities of participants, they found that 'CWP participants have experience a "mindshift" that has raised their consciousness as individual agents and as collective members of a community.' (Vawda et al 2013).

A striking expression of this is the priority given to creating an environment of care at community level. While the required labour intensity of 65% creates a predisposition towards social service work in the CWP, that alone does not seem to be sufficient explanation for the emphasis on care that pervades CWP sites nor for the levels of creativity in relation to care that are seen. In relation to Bokfontein, Langa and Von Holdt argue:

*These qualities of the CWP mean that it provides a material basis for the community to collectively imagine a different future for itself. The choice of what public goods should be provided is highly significant, and provides a fresh insight into what marginal communities most desire for themselves. In Bokfontein, there is a strong emphasis on reimagining a divided, impoverished and violent community as a caring community: the emphasis on home-based care, on ensuring that children in vulnerable families have daily access to a cooked and nutritious meal, and on establishing a crèche, provide the evidence for this....*

*Through these and other public goods, established with resources provided by the state, the Bokfontein community has been able to concretely imagine itself as a different kind of place, providing material evidence that they can work towards an alternative future, at the same time as the households of some 800 CWP workers are able to experience a new degree of income security. The importance of the symbolic dimension of the CWP impact is illustrated*



*by the way the participants in the OW decided to rename Bokfontein Ditshaba Dimaketse, 'the nations will be amazed'. (Langa and Von Holdt 2011)*

For many communities, the agency unlocked by the CWP is directed first and foremost to addressing the deficit of care - with the development process in a community starting there.

## **9. Conclusions**

The CWP was designed as a response to the structural nature of unemployment in South Africa, designed to go to scale and to use public employment to enable new forms of community-driven development, to unlock new forms of agency at the local level, and to enable economic inclusion even where markets are unable to do so.

The CWP experience illustrates what can happen when communities are able to put the transformative power of labour to use, doing useful work that improves the quality of life in their communities. In the process, the CWP is enabling forms of community development that unlock new forms of initiative and agency at the local level, and is mobilizing latent energy and underutilized resources within communities. In the process, new forms of partnership in the development process are being forged, new repertoires of organization are emerging, and new capabilities are being built amongst participants.

Unemployment takes a terrible toll on society. Its impacts go well beyond the loss of income - important as this is. Like all public employment programmes, a crucial part of the rationale for the CWP is that it enables participation in work, and the social and economic inclusion that flows from that. In addition, in a context in which communities participate in the identification of work, much of this work is focused on addressing social challenges - many of which are also in fact part of the social consequences of high unemployment. This makes the CWP a particularly powerful instrument in a context of an unemployment crisis that is decimating the social fabric of communities.

While the need for such an instrument has been particularly stark in the South African context, it is likely that the same need exists in other parts of the developing world. In the context of the current jobs crisis, there may even be useful work to be done in the developed world too.

## References

- Andersson, G. 2011. Community organization; the missing link for societal transformation. Unpublished paper.
- Andersson, G. 2013a. Community development in the CWP: First ideas. Unpublished paper.
- Andersson, G. 2013b Harnessing the Economic Benefits of EPWP. Presentation to Employment Function Sub-Group Meeting, National Treasury, 26 August 2013. Andersson and Mkhize, 2009. Proposal to the Community Works Programme Steering Committee: For the expansion of Community Works Programmes in 6 Communities. October. Seriti Institute, Johannesburg.
- Aliber, M, 2005. Synthesis and conclusions. In Aliber, M, De Swardt, C, Du Toit, A, Mbhele, T & Mthethwa, T (Eds), Trends and Policy Challenges in the Rural Economy, HRSC (Human Sciences Research Council) Press, Pretoria, pp. 87–108.
- AsgiSA (Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa), 2009. Annual Report. Presidency, Pretoria.
- Banerjee, A, Galiani, S, Levinsohn, J & Woolard, I, 2006. Why has unemployment risen in the new South Africa? Working Paper No. 134, Centre for International Development (CID), Harvard University.
- Budlender, D. (2010). “What do time use studies tell us about unpaid care work? Evidence from seven countries.” In Budlender (Ed) (2010). Time use studies and unpaid care work. Routledge, New York.
- CDI (Centre for Democratising Information) 2013. The context of public primary education and the Community work Programme. TIPS. Pretoria.
- Cochrane, M, 2011. Studying the impact of the community work programme on its participants. Unpublished paper. [...] Johannesburg.
- CWP Steering Committee. 2012. Strategy for Scaling up. Unpublished document.
- DCoG (Department of Cooperative Governance), 2011a. CWP Implementation Manual. Pretoria.
- DCoG (Department of Cooperative Governance), 2011b. Communities at Work: Community Work Programme 2010/2011. Produced by TIPS (Trade and Industrial Policy Strategies), Pretoria.
- DCoG (Department of Cooperative Governance), 2013. Annual Performance Report. Pretoria.
- DPW (Department of Public Works), 2009. Expanded Public Works Programme Five Year Report 2004/05 – 2008/09 – Reaching the One Million Target.  
[www.epwp.gov.za/downloads/EPWP\\_Five\\_Year\\_Report.pdf](http://www.epwp.gov.za/downloads/EPWP_Five_Year_Report.pdf) Accessed 8 January 2011.
- EDD (Economic Development Department) 2011. The New Growth Path: The Framework. Pretoria.
- GCIS (Government Communications and Information System), 2011. Statement on the Cabinet Lekgotla of 26–28 July 2011, Pretoria.  
[www.info.gov.za/speech/DynamicAction?pageid=461&sid=20345&tid=38379](http://www.info.gov.za/speech/DynamicAction?pageid=461&sid=20345&tid=38379) Accessed 2 November 2011.
- Klasen, S & Woolard, I, 2008. Surviving unemployment without state support: Unemployment and household formation in South Africa. *Journal of African Economies* 18(1), 1–51.

- Langa, M, and Von Holdt, H, 2011. Bokfontein: The nations are amazed. In Daniel, Naidoo, Pillay & Southall (eds) (2011) *New South African Review 2*, Johannesburg: Wits University Press
- Lieuw-Kie-Song M, Philip K, Tsukamoto M and Van Imschoot M (2010) Towards the right to work: Innovations in Public Employment Programmes (IPEP), Employment Working Paper No. 69, Employment Sector, ILO, Geneva.  
[http://www.ilo.org/employment/Whatwedo/Publications/working-papers/WCMS\\_158483/lang-en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/employment/Whatwedo/Publications/working-papers/WCMS_158483/lang-en/index.htm)
- Lima Development, 2011. Bohlabela CWP Newsletter. Issue 1 Volume 2. [www.lima.org.za](http://www.lima.org.za)
- Marock, C, 2010. Community Work Programme (CWP): Evaluation of CWP pre-inception processes, Singizi Consulting, Johannesburg. Unpublished paper.
- McCord, A, 2005. Public Works in the Context of HIV/Aids. Public Works Project, Southern African Labour and Development Research Unit (SALDRU), University of Cape Town
- Motala, S, Jacobs, P, Pienaar, D & Biersteker, L, 2011. Making the Community Work Programme (CWP) work for young children through identifying Innovations to Enhance Early Childhood Development Outcomes for Children, South Africa
- National Planning Commission, 2011. *National development Plan: Vision for 2030*. The Presidency, South Africa.
- O'Brien, O, 2011. Responding to the structural drivers of HIV. How can social science shape interventions? Locating the Social: 1st International HIV Social Science and Humanities Conference, International Conference Centre, Durban, 11-13 June 2011. Presentation.
- Philip, K, 2010. Inequality and economic marginalisation: How the structure of the economy impacts on opportunities on the margins. *Law, Democracy and Development* 14, 1–28.  
[www.idd.org.za/images/stories/Ready\\_for\\_publication/philip\\_doi.pdf](http://www.idd.org.za/images/stories/Ready_for_publication/philip_doi.pdf) Accessed 1 November 2011.
- Seriti Institute, 2009a. Seriti Institute Business Plan, July 2009. Seriti Institute, Johannesburg.
- StatsSA (Statistics South Africa). 2013a. Municipal Fact Sheet. [www.statssa.gov.za/Census2011/Products/Census\\_2011\\_Municipal\\_fact\\_sheet.pdf](http://www.statssa.gov.za/Census2011/Products/Census_2011_Municipal_fact_sheet.pdf). Accessed 5 June 2013.
- StatsSA (Statistics South Africa). 2013. Quarterly Labour Force Survey, Quarter 1. [www.statssa.gov.za/news\\_archive/Docs/QLFS\\_Press\\_statement\\_Q1\\_2013.pdf](http://www.statssa.gov.za/news_archive/Docs/QLFS_Press_statement_Q1_2013.pdf). Accessed 5 June 2013b.
- TIPS (Trade and Industrial Policy Strategies), 2009. Second Economy Strategy Project, 2009. Addressing Inequality and Economic Marginalisation: A Framework for Second Economy Strategy. TIPS Pretoria. [www.tips.org.za/programme/2nd-economy-strategy-project](http://www.tips.org.za/programme/2nd-economy-strategy-project) Accessed 1 November 2011
- TIPS (Trade and Industrial Policy Strategies), 2011. Case Study Series: Innovation in CWP. Produced for DCoG, Pretoria. [www.tips.org.za](http://www.tips.org.za) Accessed 20 December 2011.
- a. Employment Creation Fund Waste Management – Turning Waste Into Work
  - b. Early Childhood Development — Giving Children a Head Start In Life
  - c. Watershed Services River Cleaning Programme – Restoring Our Rivers
  - d. Seedling Nurseries – Sustaining Food Security,
  - e. Waste Management – Water Conservation – Bringing Resources Closer To Home.

- f. Bohlabela – Back To School
- g. Bokfontein – Building A Future.
- h. Joburg Region E – Today He Gave Her Flowers
- i. Lephephane – Community Action To Harness Delivery
- j. Manenburg – Breaking The Cycle Of Criminality
- k. Pfefferville – A Kickstart For Change
- l. Randfontein – Breathing Life Into Disused Facilities
- m. Sikhulile – Small Steps To Big Things
- n. Thusong — Bringing Hope To Small Towns
- o. Welkom - Going The Extra Mile
- p. Local Innovation

Vawda, S., Prinsloo, M., Mostert, A., & Mazibuko, N. (2013). The South African Community Capabilities Study: The Community Work Programme. Centre for Democratising Information, Pretoria.



## Employment Working Papers

2008

- 1 Challenging the myths about learning and training in small and medium-sized enterprises: Implications for public policy;  
ISBN 978-92-2-120555-5 (print); 978-92-2-120556-2 (web pdf)  
*David Ashton, Johnny Sung, Arwen Raddon, Trevor Riordan*
- 2 Integrating mass media in small enterprise development: Current knowledge and good practices;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121142-6 (print); 978-92-2-121143-3 (web pdf)  
*Gavin Anderson. Edited by Karl-Oskar Olming, Nicolas MacFarquhar*
- 3 Recognizing ability: The skills and productivity of persons with disabilities. A literature review;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121271-3 (print); 978-92-2-121272-0 (web pdf)  
*Tony Powers*
- 4 Offshoring and employment in the developing world: The case of Costa Rica;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121259-1 (print); 978-92-2-121260-7 (web pdf)  
*Christoph Ernst, Diego Sanchez-Ancochea*
- 5 Skills and productivity in the informal economy;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121273-7 (print); 978-92-2-121274-4 (web pdf)  
*Robert Palmer*
- 6 Challenges and approaches to connect skills development to productivity and employment growth: India;  
unpublished  
*C. S. Venkata Ratnam, Arvind Chaturvedi*
- 7 Improving skills and productivity of disadvantaged youth;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121277-5 (print); 978-92-2-121278-2 (web pdf)  
*David H. Freedman*
- 8 Skills development for industrial clusters: A preliminary review;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121279-9 (print); 978-92-2-121280-5 (web pdf)  
*Marco Marchese, Akiko Sakamoto*
- 9 The impact of globalization and macroeconomic change on employment in Mauritius: What next in the post-MFA era?  
ISBN 978-92-2-120235-6 (print); 978-92-2-120236-3 (web pdf)  
*Naoko Otake*

- 10 School-to-work transition: Evidence from Nepal;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121354-3 (print); 978-92-2-121355-0 (web pdf)  
*New Era*
- 11 A perspective from the MNE Declaration to the present: Mistakes, surprises and newly important policy implications;  
ISBN 978-92-2-120606-4 (print); 978-92-2-120607-1 (web pdf)  
*Theodore H. Moran*
- 12 Gobiernos locales, turismo comunitario y sus redes:  
Memoria: V Encuentro consultivo regional (REDTURS);  
ISBN 978-92-2-321430-2 (print); 978-92-2-321431-9 (web pdf)
- 13 Assessing vulnerable employment: The role of status and sector indicators in Pakistan, Namibia and Brazil;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121283-6 (print); 978-92-2-121284-3 (web pdf)  
*Theo Sparreboom, Michael P.F. de Gier*
- 14 School-to-work transitions in Mongolia;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121524-0 (print); 978-92-2-121525-7 (web pdf)  
*Francesco Pastore*
- 15 Are there optimal global configurations of labour market flexibility and security? Tackling the “flexicurity” oxymoron;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121536-3 (print); 978-92-2-121537-0 (web pdf)  
*Miriam Abu Sharkh*
- 16 The impact of macroeconomic change on employment in the retail sector in India: Policy implications for growth, sectoral change and employment;  
ISBN 978-92-2-120736-8 (print); 978-92-2-120727-6 (web pdf)  
*Jayati Ghosh, Amitayu Sengupta, Anamitra Roychoudhury*
- 17 From corporate-centred security to flexicurity in Japan;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121776-3 (print); 978-92-2-121777-0 (web pdf)  
*Kazutoshi Chatani*
- 18 A view on international labour standards, labour law and MSEs;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121753-4 (print); 978-92-2-121754-1 (web pdf)  
*Julio Faundez*
- 19 Economic growth, employment and poverty in the Middle East and North Africa;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121782-4 (print); 978-92-2-121783-1 (web pdf)  
*Mahmood Messkoub*

- 20 Global agri-food chains: Employment and social issues in fresh fruit and vegetables;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121941-5(print); 978-92-2-121942-2 (web pdf)  
*Sarah Best, Ivanka Mamic*
- 21 Trade agreements and employment: Chile 1996-2003;  
ISBN 978-92-121962-0 (print); 978-92-121963-7 (web pdf)
- 22 The employment effects of North-South trade and technological change;  
ISBN 978-92-2-121964-4 (print); 978-92-2-121965-1 (web pdf)  
*Nomaan Majid*
- 23 Voluntary social initiatives in fresh fruit and vegetable value chains;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122007-7 (print); 978-92-2-122008-4 (web pdf)  
*Sarah Best, Ivanka Mamic*
- 24 Crecimiento económico y empleo de jóvenes en Chile: Análisis sectorial y  
proyecciones;  
ISBN 978-92-2-321599-6 (print); 978-92-2-321600-9 (web pdf)  
*Mario D. Velásquez Pinto*
- 25 The impact of codes and standards on investment flows to developing countries;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122114-2 (print); 978-92-2-122115-9 (web pdf)  
*Dirk Willem te Velde*
- 26 The promotion of respect for workers' rights in the banking sector:  
Current practice and future prospects;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122116-6 (print); 978-2-122117-3 (web pdf)  
*Emily Sims*

## **2009**

- 27 Labour market information and analysis for skills development;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122151-7 (print); 978-92-2-122152-4 (web pdf)  
*Theo Sparreboom, Marcus Powell*
- 28 Global reach - Local relationships: Corporate social responsibility, worker's rights and  
local development;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122222-4 (print); 978-92-2-122212-5 (web pdf)  
*Anne Posthuma, Emily Sims*
- 29 Investing in the workforce: Social investors and international labour standards;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122288-0 (print); 978-92-2-122289-7 (web pdf)  
*Elizabeth Umlas*



- 30 Rising food prices and their implications for employment, decent work and poverty reduction;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122331-3 (print); 978-92-2-122332-0 (web pdf)  
*Rizwanul Islam, Graeme Buckley*
- 31 Economic implications of labour and labour-related laws on MSEs: A quick review of the Latin American experience;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122368-9 (print); 978-92-2-122369-6 (web pdf)  
*Juan Chacaltana*
- 32 Understanding informal apprenticeship – Findings from empirical research in Tanzania;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122351-1 (print); 978-92-2-122352-8 (web pdf)  
*Irmgard Nübler, Christine Hofmann, Clemens Greiner*
- 33 Partnerships for youth employment. A review of selected community-based initiatives;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122468-6 (print); 978-92-2-122469-3 (web pdf)  
*Peter Kenyon*
- 34 The effects of fiscal stimulus packages on employment;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122489-1 (print); 978-92-2-122490-7 (web pdf)  
*Veena Jha*
- 35 Labour market policies in times of crisis;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122510-2 (print); 978-92-2-122511-9 (web pdf)  
*Sandrine Cazes, Sher Verick, Caroline Heuer*
- 36 The global economic crisis and developing countries: Transmission channels, fiscal and policy space and the design of national responses;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122544-7 (print); 978-92-2-122545-4 (web pdf)  
*Iyanatul Islam*
- 37 Rethinking monetary and financial policy:  
Practical suggestions for monitoring financial stability while generating employment and poverty reduction;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122514-0 (print); 978-92-2-122515-7 (web pdf)  
*Gerald Epstein*
- 38 Promoting employment-intensive growth in Bangladesh: Policy analysis of the manufacturing and service sectors;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122540-9 (print); 978-92-2-122541-6 (web pdf)  
*Nazneen Ahmed, Mohammad Yunus, Harunur Rashid Bhuyan*
- 39 The well-being of labour in contemporary Indian economy: What's active labour market policy got to do with it?;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122622-2 (print); 978-92-2-122623-9 (web pdf)  
*Praveen Jha*

- 40 The global recession and developing countries;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122847-9 (print); 978-92-2-122848-6 (web pdf)  
*Nomaan Majid*
- 41 Offshoring and employment in the developing world: Business process outsourcing in the Philippines;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122845-5 (print); 978-92-2-122846-2 (web pdf)  
*Miriam Bird, Christoph Ernst*
- 42 A survey of the Great Depression as recorded in the International Labour Review, 1931-1939;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122843-1 (print); 978-92-2-122844-8 (web pdf)  
*Rod Mamudi*
- 43 The price of exclusion: The economic consequences of excluding people with disabilities from the world or work;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122921-6 (print); 978-92-2-122922-3 (web pdf)  
*Sebastian Backup*
- 44 Researching NQFs: Some conceptual issues;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123066-3 (print), 978-92-2-123067-0 (web pdf)  
*Stephanie Allais, David Raffé, Michael Young*
- 45 Learning from the first qualifications frameworks;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123068-7 (print), 978-92-2-123069-4 (web pdf)  
*Stephanie Allais, David Raffé, Rob Strathdee, Leesa Wheelahan, Michael Young*
- 46 International framework agreements and global social dialogue: Lessons from the Daimler case;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122353-5 (print); 978-92-2-122354-2 (web pdf)  
*Dimitris Stevis*

## 2010

- 47 International framework agreements and global social dialogue: Parameters and prospects;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123298-8 (print); 978-92-2-122299-5 (web pdf)  
*Dimitris Stevis*
- 48 Unravelling the impact of the global financial crisis on the South African labour market;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123296-4 (print); 978-92-2-123297-1 (web pdf)  
*Sher Verick*
- 49 Guiding structural change: The role of government in development;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123340-4 (print); 978-92-2-123341-1 (web pdf)  
*Matthew Carson*

- 50 Les politiques du marché du travail et de l'emploi au Burkina Faso;  
ISBN 978-92-2-223394-6 (print); 978-92-2-223395-3 (web pdf)  
*Lassané Ouedraogo, Adama Zerbo*
- 51 Characterizing the school-to-work transitions of young men and women:  
Evidence from the ILO school-to-work transition surveys;  
ISBN 978-92-2-122990-2 (print); 978-92-2-122991-9 (web pdf)  
*Makiko Matsumoto, Sara Elder*
- 52 Exploring the linkages between investment and employment in Moldova:  
A time-series analysis  
ISBN 978-92-2-122990-2 (print); 978-92-2-122991-9 (web pdf)  
*Stefania Villa*
- 53 The crisis of orthodox macroeconomic policy: The case for a renewed commitment to  
full employment;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123512-5 (print); 978-92-2-123513-2 (web pdf)  
*Muhammed Muqtada*
- 54 Trade contraction in the global crisis: Employment and inequality effects in India and  
South Africa;  
ISBN 978-92-2-2124037-2 (print); 978-92-2-2124038-9 (web pdf)  
*David Kucera, Leanne Roncolato, Erik von Uexkull*
- 55 The impact of crisis-related changes in trade flows on employment: Incomes, regional  
and sectoral development in Brazil;  
ISBN 978-92-2-  
*Scott McDonald, Marion Janse, Erik von Uexkull*
- 56 Envejecimiento y Empleo en América Latina y el Caribe;  
ISBN 978-92-2-323631-1 (print); 978-92-2-323632-8 (web pdf)  
*Jorge A. Paz*
- 57 Demographic ageing and employment in China;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123580-4 (print); 978-92-2-123581-1 (web pdf)  
*Du Yang, Wrang Meiyang*
- 58 Employment, poverty and economic development in Madagascar: A macroeconomic  
framework;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123398-5 (print); 978-92-2-123399-2 (web pdf)  
*Gerald Epstein, James Heintz, Léonce Ndikumana, Grace Chang*
- 59 The Korean labour market: Some historical macroeconomic perspectives;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123675-7 (print); 978-92-2-123676-4 (web pdf)  
*Anne Zooyob*

- 60 Les Accords de Partenariat Economique et le travail décent:  
Quels enjeux pour l’Afrique de l’ouest et l’Afrique centrale?;  
ISBN 978-92-2-223727-2 (print); 978-92-2-223728-9 (web pdf)  
*Eléonore d’Achon; Nicolas Gérard*
- 61 The great recession of 2008-2009: Causes, consequences and policy responses;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123729-7 (print); 978-92-2-123730-3 (web pdf)  
*Iyanatul Islam, Sher Verick*
- 62 Rwanda forging ahead: The challenge of getting everybody on board;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123771-6 (print); 978-92-2-123772-3 (web pdf)  
*Per Ronnås (ILO), Karl Backéus (Sida); Elina Scheja (Sida)*
- 63 Growth, economic policies and employment linkages in Mediterranean countries:  
The cases of Egypt, Israel, Morocco and Turkey;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123779-2 (print); 978-92-2-123780-8 (web pdf)  
*Gouda Abdel-Khalek*
- 64 Labour market policies and institutions with a focus on inclusion, equal opportunities  
and the informal economy;  
ISBN 978-92-2-123787-7 (print); 978-92-2-123788-4 (web pdf)  
*Mariangels Fortuny, Jalal Al Hussein*
- 65 Les institutions du marché du travail face aux défis du développement:  
Le cas du Mali;  
ISBN 978-92-2- 223833-0 (print); 978-92-2-223834-7 (web pdf)  
*Modibo Traore, Youssouf Sissoko*
- 66 Les institutions du marché du travail face aux défis du développement:  
Le cas du Bénin;  
ISBN 978-92-2-223913-9 (print); 978-92-2-223914-6 (web pdf)  
*Albert Honlonkou, Dominique Odjo Ogoudele*
- 67 What role for labour market policies and institutions in development?Enhancing  
security in developing countries and emerging economies;  
ISBN 978-92-2-124033-4 (print); 978-92-2-124034-1 (web pdf)  
*Sandrine Cazes, Sher Verick*
- 68 The role of openness and labour market institutions for employment dynamics during  
economic crises;  
*Elisa Geronzi, Erik von Uexkull, Sebastian Weber*
- 69 Towards the right to work:  
Innovations in Public Employment programmes (IPEP);  
ISBN 978-92-2-124236-9 (print); 978-92-2-1244237-6 (web pdf)  
*Maikel Lieuw-Kie-Song, Kate Philip, Mito Tsukamoto, Marc van Imschoot*

- 70 The impact of the economic and financial crisis on youth employment: Measures for labour market recovery in the European Union, Canada and the United States; ISBN 978-92-2-124378-6 (print); 978-92-2-124379-3 (web pdf)  
*Niall O'Higgins*
- 71 El impacto de la crisis económica y financiera sobre el empleo juvenil en América Latina: Medidas des mercado laboral para promover la recuperación del empleo juvenil; ISBN 978-92-2-324384-5 (print); 978-92-2-324385-2 (web pdf)  
*Federio Tong*
- 72 On the income dimension of employment in developing countries; ISBN: 978-92-2-124429-5 (print);978-92-2-124430-1 (web pdf)  
*Nomaan Majid*
- 73 Employment diagnostic analysis: Malawi; ISBN 978-92-2-123101-0 (print); 978-92-2-124102-7 (web pdf)  
*Per Ronnas*
- 74 Global economic crisis, gender and employment: The impact and policy response; ISBN 978-92-2-14169-0 (print); 978-92-2-124170-6 (web pdf)  
*Naoko Otake*

## 2011

- 75 Mainstreaming environmental issues in sustainable enterprises: An exploration of issues, experiences and options; ISBN 978-92-2-124557-5 (print); 978-92-2-124558-2 (web pdf)  
*Maria Sabrina De Gobbi*
- 76 The dynamics of employment, the labour market and the economy in Nepal ISBN 978-92-2-123605-3 (print); 978-92-2-124606-0 (web pdf)  
*Shagun Khare , Anja Slany*
- 77 Industrial policies and capabilities for catching-up: Frameworks and paradigms  
*Irmgard Nuebler*
- 78 Economic growth, employment and poverty reduction: A comparative analysis of Chile and Mexico ISBN 978-92-2-124783-8 (print); 978-92-2-124784-5 (web pdf)  
*Alicia Puyana*
- 79 Macroeconomy for decent work in Latin America and the Caribbean ISBN 978-92-2-024821-8 (print); 978-92-2-024822-5 (web pdf)  
*Ricardo French-Davis*

- 80 Evaluation des emplois générés dans le cadre du DSCR au Gabon  
ISBN 978-92-2-223789-0 (print) ; 978-92-2-223790-6 (web pdf)  
*Mohammed Bensid, Aomar Ibourk and Ayache Khallaf*
- 81 The Great Recession of 2008-2009: Causes, consequences and policy responses  
ISBN 978-92-2-123729-7 (print); 978-92-2-123730-3 (web pdf)  
*Iyanatul Islam and Sher Verick*
- 82 Le modèle de croissance katangais face à la crise financière mondiale : Enjeux en termes d'emplois  
ISBN 978-92-2-225236-7 (print) ; 978-92-2- 225237-4 (web pdf)  
*Frédéric Lapeyre, Philippe Lebailly, Laki Musewa M'Bayo, Modeste Mutombo Kyamakosa*
- 83 Growth, economic policies and employment linkages: Israel  
ISBN 978-92-2-123775-4 (print); 978-92-2-123778-5 (web pdf)  
*Roby Nathanson*
- 84 Growth, economic policies and employment linkages: Turkey  
ISBN 978-92-2-123781-5 (print); 978-92-2-123782-2 (web pdf)  
*Erinc Yeldan and Hakan Ercan*
- 85 Growth, economic policies and employment linkages: Egypt  
ISBN 978-92-2-123773-0 (print); 978-92-2-123774-7 (web pdf)  
*Heba Nassar*
- 86 Employment diagnostic analysis: Bosnia and Herzegovina  
ISBN 978-92-2-125043-2 (print); 978-92-2-2125044-9 (web pdf)  
*Shagun Khare, Per Ronnas and Leyla Shamchiyeva*
- 87 Should developing countries target low, single digit inflation to promote growth and employment  
ISBN 978-92-2-125050-0 (print); 978-92-2-125051-7 (web pdf )  
*Sarah Anwar, Iyanatul Islam*
- 88 Dynamic Social Accounting matrix (DySAM): concept, methodology and simulation outcomes: The case of Indonesia and Mozambique  
ISBN 978-92-2-1250418 (print); 978-92-2-1250425 (web pdf)  
*Jorge Alarcon, Christoph Ernst, Bazlul Khondker, P.D. Sharma*
- 89 Microfinance and child labour  
ISBN 978-92-2-125106-4 (print)  
*Jonal Blume and Julika Breyer*
- 90 Walking on a tightrope: Balancing MF financial sustainability and poverty orientation in Mali  
ISBN 978-92-2-124906-1 (print); 978-92-2-124907-8 (web pdf)  
*Renata Serra and Fabrizio Botti*

- 91 Macroeconomic policy “Full and productive employment and decent work for all”:  
Uganda country study  
ISBN 978-92-2-125400-3 (print); 978-92-2-125401-0 (web pdf)  
*Elisa van Waeyenberge and Hannah Bargawi*
- 92 Fiscal and political space for crisis response with a focus on employment and labour  
market: Study of Bangladesh  
ISBN 978-92-2-125402-7 (print); 978-92-2-125403-4 (web pdf)  
*Rizwanul Islam, Mustafa K. Mukeri and Zlfiqar Ali*
- 93 Macroeconomic policy for employment creation: The case of Malawi  
ISBN 978-92-2-125404-1 (print); 978-92-2-125405-8 (web pdf)  
*Sonali Deraniyagala and Ben Kaluwa*
- 94 Challenges for achieving job-rich and inclusive growth in Mongolia  
ISBN 978-92-2-125399-0 (print); 978-92-2-125398-3 (web pdf)  
*Per Ronnas*
- 95 Employment diagnostic analysis: Nusa Tenggara Timur  
ISBN 978-92-2-125412-6 (print); 978-92-2-125413-3 (web pdf)  
*Miranda Kwong and Per Ronnas*
- 96 What has really happened to poverty and inequality during the growth process in  
developing countries?  
ISBN 978-92-2-125432-4 (print); 978-92-2-125433-1 (web pdf)  
*Nomaan Majid*
- 97 ROKIN Bank: The story of workers’ organizations that successfully promote financial  
inclusion  
ISBN 978-92-2-125408-9 (print); 978-92-2-125409-6 (web pdf)  
*Shoko Ikezaki*
- 98 Employment diagnostic analysis: Maluku, Indonesia  
ISBN 978-92-2-12554690 (print); 978-92-2-1254706 (web pdf)  
*Per Ronnas and Leyla Shamchiyeva*
- 99 Employment trends in Indonesia over 1996-2009: Casualization of the labour market  
during an ear of crises, reforms and recovery  
ISBN 978-92-2-125467-6 (print); 978-92-2-125468-3 (web pdf)  
*Makiko Matsumoto and Sher Verick*
- 100 The impact of the financial and economic crisis on ten African economies and labour  
markets in 2008-2010: Findings from the ILO/WB policy inventory (forthcoming)  
ISBN 978-92-2-125595-6 (print); 978-92-2-125596-3 (web pdf)  
*Catherine Saget and Jean-Francois Yao*

- 101 Rights at work in times of crisis: Trends at the country-level in terms of compliance with International Labour Standards (forthcoming)  
ISBN 978-92-2-125560-4 (print); 978-92-2-125561-1 (web pdf)  
*David Tajzman, Catherine Saget, Natan Elkin and Eric Gravel*
- 102 Social dialogue during the financial and economic crisis: Results from the ILO/World Bank Inventory using a Boolean analysis on 44 countries (forthcoming)  
ISBN 978-92-2-125617-5 (print); 978-92-2-125618-2 (web pdf)  
*Lucio Baccaro and Stefan Heeb*
- 103 Promoting training and employment opportunities for people with intellectual disabilities: International experience  
ISBN 978-92-2-1254973 (print); 978-92-2-125498-0 (web pdf)  
*Trevor R. Parmenter*
- 104 Towards an ILO approach to climate change adaptation  
ISBN 978-92-2-125625-0 (print); 978-92-2-125626-7 (web pdf)  
*Marek Harsdorff, Maikel Lieuw-Kie-Song, Mito Tsukamoto*
- 105 Addressing the employment challenge:  
India's MGNREGA  
ISBN 978-92-2-125687-8 (print); 978-92-2-125688-5 (web pdf)  
*Ajit Ghose*
- 106 Diverging trends in unemployment in the United States and Europe: Evidence from Okun's law and the global financial crisis  
ISBN 978-92-2-125711-0 (print); 978-92-2-125712-7 (web pdf)  
*Sandrine Cazes, Sher Verick and Fares Al Hussami*
- 107 Macroeconomic policy for full and productive and decent employment for all:  
The case of Nigeria  
ISBN 978-92-2-125693-5 (print); 978-92-2-125696-0 (web pdf)  
*Ugochukwu Agu, Chijioke J. Evoh*
- 108 Macroeconomics of growth and employment:  
The case of Turkey  
ISBN 978-92-1-125732-5 (print); 978-92-2-125733-2 (web pdf)  
*Erinc Yeldan*
- 109 Macroeconomic policy for full and productive employment and decent work for all:  
An analysis of the Argentine experience  
ISBN 978-92-2-125827-8 (print); 978-92-2-125828-5 (web pdf)  
*Mario Damill, Roberto Frenkel and Roxana Maurizio*



- 110 Macroeconomic policy for full and productive employment and decent work for all:  
Sri Lanka country study  
ISBN 978-92-2-125845-2 (print); 978-92-2-12584-6 (web pdf)  
*Dushni Weerakoon and Nisha Arunatilake*

## 2012

- 111 Promotion of cluster development for enterprise growth and job creation  
ISBN 978-92-2 - unpublished
- 112 Employment dimension of trade liberalization with China:  
Analysis of the case of Indonesia with dynamic social accounting matrix  
ISBN 978-92-2-125766-0 (print); 978-92-2-125767-7 (web pdf)  
*Christoph Ernst and Ralph Peters*
- 113 Social protection and minimum wages responses to the 2008 financial and economic crisis: Findings from the International Labour Office (ILO) /World Bank (WB) Inventory  
ISBN 978-92-2-126041-7 (print); 978-92-2-126042-4 (web pdf)  
*Florence Bonnet, Catherine Saget and Axel Weber*
- 114 Mapping and analysis of growth-oriented industrial sub-sectors and their skill requirements in Bangladesh  
ISBN 978-92-2-126028-8 (print); 978-92-2-126029-5 (web pdf)  
*Rushidan Islam Rahman, Abdul Hye MondaL and Rizwanul Islam*
- 115 Gender and the environment:  
A survey in the manufacturing in the machine-parts sector in Indonesia and China  
ISBN 978-92-2-126165-0 (print); 978-92-2-126166-7 (web pdf)  
*Maria Sabrina de Gobbi - unpublished*
- 116 Employment implications of the “Five – Hubs Strategy” of Sri Lanka  
*Sirimal Abeyrathne*
- 117 Preferential trade agreements and the labour market  
*Emanuel Ornelas*
- 118 Macroeconomic policies and employment in Jordan:  
Tackling the paradox of job-poor growth  
*Sahar Taghdisi-Rad*
- 119 Globalization, trade unions and labour standards in the North  
*Alejandro Donado and Klaus Walde*

- 120 Regional trade agreements and domestic labour market regulation  
*Christian Häbberli, Marion Jansen, José-Antonio Monteiro*
- 121 Strategies for unions to provide benefits and financial services to workers:  
Experiences in the United States  
*Richard C. Koven*
- 122 Preliminary assessment of training and retraining programmes implemented in  
response of the Great Recession  
*Ellen Hansen and Zulum Avila*
- 123 Contribution of labour market policies and institutions to inclusion through  
employment, equal opportunities and the formalisation of the informal  
economy:  
Morocco  
*Aomar Ibourk*
- 124 Tackling the youth employment crisis:  
A macroeconomic perspective  
*Makiko Matsumoto, Martina Hengge, Iyanatul Islam*
- 125 Well-being and the non material dimension of work  
*Duncan Campbell*
- 126 Labour related provisions in international investment agreements  
*Bertram Boie*
- 127 An examination of approaches to employment in two South African case study  
cities  
Cities with jobs: Confronting the employment challenge  
*Glen Robbins and Sarah Hobbs*
- 128 Sao Paulo – Brazil – The case of Osasco  
Cities with jobs: Confronting the employment challenge  
*Jeroen Klink*
- 129 Promoting employment in Marikana and Quezon City, Philippines  
Cities with jobs: Confronting the employment challenge  
*Eugenio M. Gonzales*
- 130 Cities with jobs: Confronting the employment challenge  
A policy paper  
*Adrian Atkinson*

- 131 Cities with jobs: Confronting the employment challenge  
A research report  
*Adrian Atkinson*
- 132 Trade and employment in services:  
The case of Indonesia  
*Chris Manning and Haryo Aswicahyono*
- 133 Employment protection and collective bargaining:  
Beyond the deregulation agenda  
*Sandrine Cazes, Sameer Khatiwada and Miguel Malo*
- 134 Implications of the recent macroeconomic policies on employment and labour  
market outcomes in Peru  
*Maria Lucia Guerra*
- 135 Local governance and the informal economy:  
Experiences in promoting decent work in the Philippines  
*Reginald M. Indon and Sandra O. Yu*
- 136 How not to count the employed in developing countries  
*Nomaan Majid*

## **2013**

- 137 Towards more inclusive employment policy making: Process and role of  
stakeholders in four selected countries  
*Claire Harasty*
- 138 Globalization, employment and gender in the open economy of Sri Lanka  
*Naoko Otake*
- 139 Promoting employment intensive growth in Sri Lanka  
*Sunil Chandrasiri*
- 140 The Philippines employment projections model: Employment targeting and  
scenarios  
*Souleima El Achkar Hilal, Theo Sparreboom and Douglas Meade*
- 141 Disabled beggars in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia  
*Nora Groce and Barbara Murray*

- 142 An anatomy of the French labour market  
Country case study on labour market segmentation  
*Thomas Le Barbanchon, Franck Malherbet*
- 143 Beyond the contract type segmentation in Spain  
Country case study on labour market segmentation  
*Carlos Garcá-Serrano, Miguel A. Malo*
- 144 Italy: A dual labour market in transition  
Country case study on labour market segmentation  
*Pietro Garibaldi, Filippo Taddei*
- 145 Has atypical work become typical in Germany?  
Country case study on labour market segmentation  
*Wener Eichhorst, Verena Tobsch*

## **Employment Working Papers**

**A complete list of previous working papers can be found on:  
<http://www.ilo.org/employment>**

# Employment Sector

**For more information visit our site:  
<http://www.ilo.org/employment>**

International Labour Office  
Employment Sector  
4, route des Morillons  
CH-1211 Geneva 22

Email: [edempdoc@ilo.org](mailto:edempdoc@ilo.org)